

KWONG-LOI SHUN

DIMENSIONS OF HUMILITY IN EARLY CONFUCIAN THOUGHT

Journal of Chinese Philosophy 48 (2021): 13-27

Abstract

Through an examination of the problematic forms of pride highlighted in early texts and the traits to which they are opposed, the paper identifies three main dimensions of humility in early Confucian thought. These include a deflated self-conception, caution and fearfulness, as well as seriousness and awe. It then shows that the term *jing* 敬 is closely related to all three dimensions, and hence that this is the term in early Confucian thought closest to encompassing all the different aspects of humility understood in a broad sense.

I. PRIDE AND HUMILITY

Wang Yangming (1472-1529) once comments:

“A great defect in life is *ao* 傲... One should not harbor any (self); to have (a self) is *ao* ... To be without a self (*wu wo* 無我) is *qian* 謙. *Qian* is the foundation of all goodness, and *ao* the chief of all evil.”¹

The terms *ao* and *qian* are often translated as “pride” and “humility” respectively, but I have deliberately left the two terms untranslated. *Ao* is related to other terms, notably *jiao* 驕, referring to traits that can be described as problematic forms of pride, and *qian* related to other terms

referring to traits that can be described as different aspects of humility. I will reserve the use of “pride” and “humility” to refer to the broader phenomena that encompass these traits.

Wang’s interest in pride and humility is a continuation of a similar interest in early Confucian thought. In this paper, I will discuss the early Confucian understanding of pride and humility primarily through an examination of the relevant terms. Since the use of these terms is shared by other early thinkers, I will draw on the whole corpus of texts up to early Han, though with greater emphasis on texts with a Confucian orientation. After discussing the varieties of pride highlighted in these texts, I will identify three dimensions of humility comprising traits opposed to pride. I then conclude with a discussion of *jing* 敬, the term closest to encompassing all three dimensions. Thus, the paper is also an exploration of the Confucian understanding of *jing*.

This study will focus on four clusters of terms. The first includes those that convey various forms of pride. Aside from *jiao* and *ao*, there are several other related terms. For example, *jiao* is used in association with *kua* 夸², *jin* 矜³, *jin* and *fa* 伐⁴, *fa* and *ao* 敖⁵, *jin* and *kua* 侔⁶, *tai* 泰 (in a problematic sense)⁷, *ao* 傲 and *tai*⁸. The first cluster includes:

1. *Tai* 泰, *jiao* 驕, *ao* 傲 (and *ao* 敖), *kua* 夸 (and *kua* 侔), *fa* 伐, *jin* 矜.

The second cluster includes terms related to the first dimension of humility, which I will label “deflated self-conception”. It has two sub-groups. The first includes:

- 2a. *Man* 滿, *ying* 盈, *yi* 溢.

Man and *ying* are used to convey traits similar or opposed to those in the first cluster, depending on context. *Man* is non-problematic when used in the context of being full without overflowing (*man er bu yi* 滿而不溢), a quality opposed to *jiao*⁹, but problematic when it involves viewing oneself as full, a phenomenon related to *jin*¹⁰ as well as to *jin* and *fa*¹¹. *Ying* is non-problematic

when used in the context of being full without overflowing (*ying ger bu yi* 盈而不溢), a quality opposed to *jiao* and *jin*¹², but problematic when it involves viewing oneself as full when empty (*xu er wei ying* 虛而為盈)¹³. *Yi*, on the other hand, is usually problematic and is used in the combination *jiao yi* 驕溢¹⁴.

The second sub-group includes:

2b. *Qian* 謙, *rang* 讓, *bei* 卑.

Rang is contrasted with *jiao*¹⁵ and *fa*¹⁶ while *bei* is contrasted with *jiao*.¹⁷ *Qian* is used in relation to *bei*¹⁸, *ying*¹⁹, *bei* and *ying*²⁰, *man*²¹, *man* and *rang*²², and it is explicitly contrasted with *jiao ying*.²³

The third cluster includes terms related to the second dimension of humility, which I will label “caution and fearfulness”:

3. *Ju* 懼, *kong* 恐, *jie* 戒, *shen* 慎.

Jiao is contrasted with *ju*²⁴, *kong*²⁵, *jie*²⁶, and these three terms are often used along with *shen*²⁷.

The fourth cluster includes terms related to the third dimension of humility, which I will label “seriousness and awe”:

4. *Gong* 恭, *zhuang* 莊, and *wei* 畏.

Gong is contrasted with *jiao*²⁸, *ao* 敖²⁹ and *fa*³⁰, and is related to *qian*³¹ and *rang*³². The combination *gong jing* 恭敬 is contrasted with *jiao* and *ao* 傲³³, while *gong* and *jing* are separately contrasted with *jiao*³⁴. *Zhuang* often occurs in combination with *jing* and is contrasted with *jin*³⁵. In addition, *wei* is contrasted with *jiao*³⁶ and *ao* 傲³⁷, is presented as a posture that accompanies *yan gong* 嚴恭³⁸ and a response to *yan zhuang* 嚴莊³⁹.

We will discuss these four clusters in sections 2 to 5 respectively, concluding with a discussion of *jing* in section 6.

II. PRIDE AND ITS VARIETIES

The term *tai* need not be problematic, as when the superior person is described as *tai* without being *jiao* (*tai er bu jiao* 泰而不驕).⁴⁰ It is problematic when referring to excessiveness⁴¹, in which case it is associated with terms with similar connotations, including *shen* 甚⁴², *she* 奢⁴³, *chi* 侈⁴⁴, and *yin* 淫⁴⁵. It can also be problematic when one takes oneself to have much when one has little (*yue er wei tai* 約而為泰).⁴⁶ That *jiao* is often used with *tai* in the combination *jiao tai* 驕泰⁴⁷ shows that *jiao* also involves a problematic form of excessiveness. Just as being fierce is a problematic variation on being awe-inspiring, *jiao* is a problematic variation on *tai* in the sense of having plenty.⁴⁸

Jiao can concern various areas of life, including wealth⁴⁹, wealth and honor⁵⁰, occupying a high position⁵¹, and military victory.⁵² What renders *jiao* problematic is a conception of oneself as having plenty, in a way that adversely affects the way one approaches the relevant areas of life. One adverse effect is excessiveness, conveyed through *jiao*'s association with *she*⁵³, *chi*⁵⁴ and *yin*⁵⁵. Another adverse effect is laxity, conveyed through its association with *yi* 佚⁵⁶, *dai man* 怠慢⁵⁷, and *huan dai* 緩怠⁵⁸; in the military context, one becomes lacking in strategy.⁵⁹ To reinforce this self-conception, *jiao* also leads to greed to acquire even more for oneself.⁶⁰

This self-conception also leads to an adverse comparative judgment on others, as conveyed by the verbal use of *jiao* directed to people in general (*jiao ren* 驕人)⁶¹ or those below

oneself (*jiao xia* 驕下).⁶² One takes others lightly (*qing* 輕)⁶³, resulting in insulting treatment as conveyed by the combinations *jiao wu* 驕侮⁶⁴ and *qing wu* 輕侮.⁶⁵ This disdainful attitude also manifests itself in one's demeanor and appearance (*se* 色)⁶⁶ and in one's violation of the rites (*li* 禮).⁶⁷

The use of *ao* 傲 and its variant *ao* 敖 is often similar to *jiao*. Someone in a high position might be *ao* 傲⁶⁸ and direct this attitude toward those below.⁶⁹ It is related to extravagance⁷⁰ and to laxity, as reflected in the combinations *dai ao* 怠傲⁷¹, *dai ao* 怠敖⁷², *ao man* 傲慢⁷³, *ao man* 敖慢⁷⁴, *duo ao* 惰傲⁷⁵, and *ao duo* 敖惰.⁷⁶ *Ao* 敖 also manifests itself in one's bearing (*rong* 容).⁷⁷

Four considerations show that, while *jiao* involves a more conscious comparison with others, *ao* involves a conception of oneself as on a “high” level without similar conscious comparison. First, *ao* 傲 occurs more frequently in contexts that emphasize one's viewing oneself as in a “high” position as such, as reflected in the combination *gao ao* 高傲⁷⁸, while *jiao* does not similarly occur. Second, *jiao* often involves one's taking others lightly (*qing* 輕), which implies a more conscious view of others as being “below” oneself, while this is not true of *ao*. *Ao* 敖 is on occasion used in association with *qing* when someone is described as “being above the world and taking worldly things lightly” (*ao shi qing wu* 敖世輕物)⁷⁹, but the emphasis here is on aloofness rather than comparison with others. Third, while *jiao* is often associated with a deliberate slighting of others, *ao* 傲 is illustrated by examples reflecting one's view of one's “high” position without deliberately slighting others, such as giving unsought advice to others⁸⁰ or speaking to an unsuited audience about the Way.⁸¹ In the military context, *ao* 傲 involves a

high opinion of one's military strength leading to fondness for warfare (*hao bing* 好兵)⁸², while *jiao* involves a more conscious comparison with opponents by taking them lightly (*qing di* 輕敵).⁸³ And fourth, when *jiao* is used alongside *ao* 傲 or *ao* 敖, it is often used verbally to refer to one's deliberately slighting others. For example, one takes an aloof position (*ju ao* 倨傲) so as to display one's superiority to others (*yi jiao yi ren* 以驕溢人)⁸⁴, and demonstrates one's aloof position (*ao* 敖) by using one's airs to display one's superiority to others (*yi ru se jiao ren* 以汝色驕人).⁸⁵

While *jiao* and *ao* both involve a conception of oneself as being above others, *kua* 夸 (and its variant *kua* 誇), *fa* 伐 and *jin* 衿 focus more on problematic ways of self-presentation. Of the three, *kua* more heavily emphasizes the blatant falsity of the appearance one puts up. The combination *kua dan* 夸誕 is used in parallel to what is faked and deceptive and contrasted with what is genuine and sincere.⁸⁶ Just as one disguises one's true nature in order to acquire a name (*zhao ming* 招名), one advocates morality in order to impress people (*kua ren* 夸人).⁸⁷ Another example is to decline wealth and honor in order to acquire the corresponding name (*kua yi ming* 夸以名).⁸⁸ Thus, *kua* primarily concerns putting on a false appearance to acquire a name.

Fa and *jin* are frequently used in parallel⁸⁹ and also in the combination *fa jin* 伐衿.⁹⁰ *Fa* involves drawing others' attention to some good qualities about oneself that is relatively visible, such as one's accomplishments (*gong* 功)⁹¹, the public benefits (*de* 德) they bring⁹², and the efforts involved (*lao* 勞).⁹³ In doing so, one tends to beautify them – *fa* over-extends one's actions in the way that flowery speech over-extends one's words.⁹⁴ The purpose is to acquire a

certain name and reputation – *fa* is associated with *ming* 名⁹⁵, *yu* 譽⁹⁶, and *ming yu* 名譽⁹⁷ – and such a concern is reflected in one’s own demeanor and appearance (*se* 色).⁹⁸

Jin is also directed to acquiring a name and reputation (*ming yu* 名譽)⁹⁹ and affects one’s bearing (*rong* 容).¹⁰⁰ In fact, both *jin* and *fa* are used together to make the points that they stem from a concern to “buy” a reputation and establish a name for oneself¹⁰¹ and are reflected in one’s demeanor and appearance.¹⁰² The difference between the two is that *jin* concerns good qualities of oneself that are by comparison less visible. For example, *fa* concerns one’s accomplishments while *jin* concerns one’s abilities¹⁰³, and *fa* concerns the benefits one brings while *jin* concerns one’s clear discernment regarding the merits of teachings.¹⁰⁴ *Jin* is also used in relation to one’s wisdom and abilities¹⁰⁵ as well as goodness in oneself¹⁰⁶, which are all less easily visible than actual accomplishments and benefits. Since *jin* concerns qualities that are less visible, it carries a greater potential for false representation. It can involve one’s shifting between two opposing qualities, taking on the appearance of one when the other is not well-received¹⁰⁷, and *jin* is at times associated with what is faked¹⁰⁸, merging in its extreme form into the kind of blatant falsity that characterizes *kua*.

Kua, *fa* and *jin* all involve a concern with others’ favorable opinion of oneself. While *jiao* and *ao* involve a conception of oneself as being in a “high” position, these three terms involve a conception of oneself as being deserving of and “elevated” by the favorable opinion of others. These varieties of pride derive from a common human tendency to elevate oneself¹⁰⁹ and to raise oneself above others.¹¹⁰ Such a tendency is manifested in many different ways, such as a desire to win over others¹¹¹, to use devious arguments to suppress others¹¹², or to always insist on one’s being right.¹¹³ Early texts contain numerous other descriptions of problematic forms of pride, such as the presentation in the *Zhuangzi* 《莊子》 of the “four evils”: taking on huge

undertakings and changes in pursuit of accomplishments and reputation, encroaching on others' work to represent it as one's own, refusing to correct one's errors even when remonstrated with, and consistently endorsing those who agree with oneself but disapproving others who differ.¹¹⁴ What is common to these varieties is an "inflated" self-conception of oneself, seeing oneself as in a "high" position and seeking to "elevate" oneself to reinforce such a self-conception.

III. FIRST DIMENSION OF HUMILITY – DEFLATED SELF-CONCEPTION

There are two ways in which *man* 滿, *ying* 盈, and *yi* 溢 can be used to refer to problematic forms of pride. First, one may not have some desirable quality but makes a claim to having it, a point conveyed by *xu er wei ying* 虛而為盈¹¹⁵ and *wei ying er yi* 未盈而溢.¹¹⁶ Second, whether one has that quality or not, one may form a conscious self-conception of oneself being filled with it, a point put in terms of one's being full of oneself (*zi man* 自滿¹¹⁷, 自滿假¹¹⁸, and *jiao ying* 驕盈¹¹⁹) or overflowing (*jiao yi* 驕溢).¹²⁰

In opposition to the second variant of pride, one should ideally not have such a conscious self-conception, a point conveyed in terms of "being full without overflowing" (*man er bu yi* 滿而不溢¹²¹ and *ying er bu yi* 盈而不溢¹²²); this is the way to "hold on to fullness" (*chi man* 持滿).¹²³ And the *Xunzi* 《荀子》 describes the way to "hold on to fullness" in terms of one's abiding by the apparent opposite of what one has – simplicity when sagely and wise, yielding (*rang* 讓) when accomplishments are tremendous, timidity when courageous, and *qian* 謙 when possessions are plenty.¹²⁴ Accordingly, the ideal person would have the substance but appear unfilled (*shi ru xu* 實如虛¹²⁵ or *shi ruo xu* 實若虛¹²⁶). Thus, in opposition to the second variant

of pride, one should adopt a posture that is the opposite of the first variant of pride, namely, viewing oneself as being unfilled even if one is filled.

This “deflated” self-conception is conveyed by the term *qian*, which is idealized in the *Xunzi*¹²⁷ and *Liji* 《禮記》¹²⁸ and particularly so as one of the hexagrams in the *Yijing* 《易經》, the latter describing it as the handle of virtue (*de* 德) and regulator of the rites.¹²⁹ The *Shangshu* 《尚書》 opposes *qian* to *man*, a conscious self-conception of being filled, noting that the former leads to gain and the latter to loss.¹³⁰ The *Yijing* similarly opposes *qian* to *ying*¹³¹ and idealizes the former, presenting the Way of Heaven as augmenting the former and diminishing the latter.¹³² As the “deflated” self-conception that underlies traits opposed to pride, *qian* is often mentioned in connection with these traits, such as viewing oneself in a low position (*bei* 卑¹³³ or *qian xia* 謙下¹³⁴). The superior person who devotes efforts (*lao* 勞) and is *qian* is someone who does not make a display of success (*bu fa* 不伐) nor claim credit (*bu de* 不德) but instead places himself below others (*xia ren* 下人).¹³⁵

Rang 讓 and *bei* 卑 emphasize two aspects of this “deflated” self-conception that concern one’s relation to others – being yielding rather than competing, and lowering rather than elevating oneself. *Rang* is explicitly presented as a form of virtue¹³⁶ and even described as the chief of virtue¹³⁷ for which there is no comparison.¹³⁸ At the same time, *rang* is the most important aspect of the rites¹³⁹, while *bei rang* is described as the basis of virtue¹⁴⁰ and the source of the rites.¹⁴¹

Rang involves yielding to others. In the political context, it can be a matter of yielding a position to those one regards as more worthy than oneself.¹⁴² In relation to the rites in a drinking ceremony¹⁴³ or in the ancestral temple¹⁴⁴, it involves exchanging bows and mutually yielding as

one proceeds. But the emphasis is not on the physical procedures¹⁴⁵ which is merely a matter of good form rather than the rites.¹⁴⁶ Instead, *rang* has to do with countering the human tendency at competitiveness (*zheng* 爭¹⁴⁷ or *zheng duo* 爭奪¹⁴⁸). With *rang*, one yields upon seeing gains for oneself¹⁴⁹ instead of being subject to greed¹⁵⁰, and will not act to suppress others.¹⁵¹ In this way, *rang* serves as an antidote to the various forms of pride such as *fa*¹⁵² and *jiao*.¹⁵³

Bei is also explicitly opposed to *jiao*¹⁵⁴ and emphasizes viewing oneself as in a low position rather than elevating oneself. *Bei* and *rang* together highlight two related aspects of a more general phenomenon, with *bei* focused on restraining oneself and *rang* on yielding to others. That phenomenon is put in general terms as “lowering oneself and elevating others”¹⁵⁵; it is the spirit of the rites and is contrasted with *jiao*.¹⁵⁶ It is also instantiated in a variety of ways, such as “exalting others and abasing oneself, putting others first and oneself last”¹⁵⁷, “ascribing what is good to others and what is problematic to oneself”¹⁵⁸, or “placing oneself beneath others”¹⁵⁹ instead of “elevating oneself at the expense of lowering others”.¹⁶⁰

IV. SECOND DIMENSION OF HUMILITY – CAUTION AND FEARFULNESS

Pride leads to laxity as opposed to a posture of caution and fearfulness. The idea of fearfulness emphasizes one’s being on guard against problematic occurrences and is conveyed primarily by *ju* 懼 and *kong* 恐, and to some extent *jie* 戒. The idea of caution does not place special emphasis on problematic occurrences and is conveyed primarily by *jie* and *shen* 慎.

Ju can be used in relation to something that poses a threat to which one has a strong aversion, or to refer to an apprehensive attitude not tied to any specific threat. In the former case, *ju* can be triggered by some specific occurrence, such as a ruler learning about an alliance

between opponent states¹⁶¹ or a wife's response to the prospect of being uncovered as the murderer of her husband.¹⁶² When so triggered, *ju* is often accompanied by a sense of shock, as reflected in the combinations *jing ju* 驚懼¹⁶³ and *ti ju* 惕懼.¹⁶⁴ *Ju* can also be a response to ongoing circumstances rather than specific occurrences, such as potential conquest by a powerful neighboring state¹⁶⁵, the advancing age of parents (and hence approach of death)¹⁶⁶, the spread of corrupt teachings¹⁶⁷, and inappropriate conduct by a lord.¹⁶⁸ *Ju* can also be directed to some potential threat not related to specific occurrences or circumstances but simply by virtue of its significance. Examples include the loss of virtue¹⁶⁹, death¹⁷⁰, criminal offence and punishment¹⁷¹, calamities¹⁷², and disgrace to oneself¹⁷³ or one's parents.¹⁷⁴ On this usage, *ju* is contrasted with joy (*xi* 喜)¹⁷⁵ and associated with anxiety (*you* 憂).¹⁷⁶

Ju can also refer to a general apprehensive posture not tied to any specific threat, one presented in the *Shangshu* as appropriate to the ruler.¹⁷⁷ When so used, *ju* likely still emphasizes potential problems that one needs to pre-empt. For example, the worthy ruler is the more *ju* the more his territory expands, and he ponders on dangers when in safety, deprivation when plentiful, and loss when in attainment.¹⁷⁸ *Ju* in this usage is also associated with a dedicated and deliberative attitude. Someone who is *ju* would not dare to be lax¹⁷⁹, is fond of planning to bring things to completion¹⁸⁰, and would seek to find out what is incorrect when deliberating about what is correct.¹⁸¹

Ju is used in parallel to *kong*¹⁸² and frequently in the combination *kong ju* 恐懼.¹⁸³ The use of *kong* is similar to *ju* in many respects. *Kong* is typically directed to something potentially problematic, such as a king's *kong* about being amiss in government¹⁸⁴, a minister's *kong* about being replaced¹⁸⁵, and a ruler's *kong* about loss of territory¹⁸⁶, animosity of neighboring states¹⁸⁷,

or rebellion of the people.¹⁸⁸ Even the objects of *kong* are similar to *ju*, such as criminal offence and punishment¹⁸⁹, endangerment¹⁹⁰, disgrace of ancestor¹⁹¹, and death¹⁹² or being killed.¹⁹³ *Kong* is also contrasted with joy¹⁹⁴, associated with anxiety¹⁹⁵, and along with *ju* associated with a dedicated and deliberative attitude.¹⁹⁶ *Kong* is explicitly contrasted with various forms of pride such as *jiao ao* 驕傲.¹⁹⁷

Despite their similarities, *kong* differs from *ju* in that it is typically used in relation to the possibility of problematic occurrences rather than their imminence or likelihood. In the political context, *kong* might concern the possibility that one's virtue be not comparable to one's predecessors¹⁹⁸, that a certain state attacking another might have one's own state as its real target¹⁹⁹, that one's military might not be up to the task²⁰⁰, or that one cannot hold on to the territories one has acquired.²⁰¹ Other examples include *kong* regarding the possibility that certain semblances of virtue be mistaken for genuine virtue²⁰², that one might lose one's wealth²⁰³ or what one has learnt²⁰⁴, or that the proper relation between men and women be overlooked.²⁰⁵ *Kong* might even be directed toward some possible problem whose nature one is not sure about, such as some ominous event²⁰⁶ or potentially bad outcomes of divination.²⁰⁷ Thus, *kong* is more like being concerned, worried, or afraid that something bad might happen, unlike *ju* which is more like fear, or fearing that something bad might happen along with some noticeable emotional response.

Turning to *jie* 戒, it concerns one's acute awareness of the importance of certain areas of life and vigilance about what needs to be done or avoided. For example, the *Shangshu* speaks of *jie* in relation to virtue²⁰⁸, the *Lunyu* 《論語》 refers to the three *jie* at three different stages of life²⁰⁹, and the *Zhuangzi* refers to decree (*ming* 命) and righteousness (*yi* 義) as the two great *jie*.²¹⁰ *Jie* can also refer to such a posture without specifying any area of life²¹¹, and is used

verbally to urge someone to adopt such a posture.²¹² Being *jie*, one will not be lax²¹³ or forgetful²¹⁴, and so *jie* is opposed to *jiao*.²¹⁵ In government, for example, one would learn from history about the source of order and disorder so as to *jie* oneself.²¹⁶

At times, *jie* is used in relation to specific problems that one needs to be on guard against, such as strong military opponents²¹⁷ or various forms of pride.²¹⁸ Relatedly, it can refer to one's warning someone against such potential problems.²¹⁹ Being on guard, one will carefully plan and deliberate, and will be well-prepared (*bei* 備) for whatever dangers might come²²⁰, especially in a military context.²²¹ This use of *jie* accounts for its association with *ju* in the sense of an apprehensive attitude, as reflected in the combination *jie ju* 戒懼.²²²

Finally, *shen* 慎 is like *jie* and unlike *kong* and *ju* in that it concerns a posture of caution not specifically linked to problematic occurrences, accounting for its more frequent association with *jie*²²³ including in the combination *jie shen* 戒慎.²²⁴ In the governmental context, one can be *shen* in relation to the throne that one occupies²²⁵, official responsibilities²²⁶, governmental affairs²²⁷, the issue of orders²²⁸, the recommendation of officials²²⁹, the education of a prince²³⁰ and selection of his teacher²³¹, punishment²³², as well as the institution of rites and music.²³³ Other examples include *shen* in listening²³⁴, the choice of profession²³⁵, one's comportment²³⁶, the influences one is exposed to²³⁷, the way one conducts oneself²³⁸, one's words²³⁹ and actions²⁴⁰, the conclusion of an affair or a life²⁴¹, as well as *du* 獨, which likely refers to the subtle incipient movements of the heart/mind.²⁴²

At times, *shen* is directed to something positively valued such as virtue²⁴³ or making luminous one's virtue.²⁴⁴ At times, it is directed to something negatively valued such as crime and wickedness²⁴⁵, exposure to problematic words and action²⁴⁶, and problematic behavior.²⁴⁷ In all these instances, the emphasis is on exercising caution to ensure that one proceeds properly.

For this purpose, one needs to ponder on (*si* 思)²⁴⁸ and deliberate about (*lu* 慮)²⁴⁹ what is proper or improper, and *shen* also occurs in the combinations *shen si* 慎思²⁵⁰ and *shen lu* 慎慮²⁵¹ to emphasize caution in these two processes themselves. This emphasis on careful pondering and deliberation distinguishes *shen* from *jie*, the latter emphasizing primarily the importance one attaches to a certain area of life.

Another distinguishing characteristic of *shen* is its emphasis on minute details of the way one proceeds. It involves careful discriminatory judgement about different courses of action and their consequences, such as the way one will be judged by one's words²⁵², the nature of different professions that one takes up²⁵³, or what the different qualities of a person might give rise to.²⁵⁴ In a comment on the ideal operation of the heart/mind, one is urged to be *jie* in relation to potential errors and *shen* in relation to what is minute (*jie guo shen wei* 戒過慎微).²⁵⁵ Its use in relation to *du* 獨 and *wei* 微, both referring to the minute movements of the heart/mind that can easily go astray, confirms this point.

V. THIRD DIMENSION OF HUMILITY – SERIOUSNESS AND AWE

We saw earlier that *gong* 恭 is opposed to *jiao*, *ao* and *fa* and related to *qian* and *rang*. Two points are worthy noting regarding *gong*. First, as it is often used in connection with personal interactions, it may appear to concern primarily such interactions. For example, it characterizes the way a ruler receives ministers²⁵⁶ or approaches the common people²⁵⁷, the way one presents offerings to a king²⁵⁸ or listens to an elder²⁵⁹, and the interaction between host and guest.²⁶⁰ But *gong* is also used in contexts not primarily about personal interactions, such as in relation to the spirits²⁶¹, official responsibilities²⁶², the way the king executes the punishment

ordained by Heaven²⁶³, the way one silently reflects on the Way²⁶⁴, and the way one conducts oneself in general²⁶⁵ including in one's own home.²⁶⁶

Second, it may appear that *gong* primarily concerns one's outward appearance and conduct. For example, it characterizes one's appearance²⁶⁷, body²⁶⁸, hand (movements)²⁶⁹, as well as Shun's posture while sitting facing south.²⁷⁰ In conduct, it is often related to the rites²⁷¹ and contrasted with insult.²⁷² But *gong* is not just a matter of outward appearance and conduct. For example, the *Mengzi* 《孟子》 speaks of the heart/mind of *gong* when interacting with others²⁷³ and distinguishes it from a pleasant outer appearance.²⁷⁴ It also refers to the heart/mind of *gong jing*²⁷⁵, which should be present before the presentation of a gift, implying that it is a posture of the heart/mind.²⁷⁶

A hint regarding the nature of this posture is found in *gong*'s relation to *jian* 儉, being appropriately conservative in expenditure. The combination *gong jian* 恭儉 occurs frequently²⁷⁷, and the two terms are often used in parallel²⁷⁸ such as in the comment that one does not aim at *jiao* with respect to official position nor at extravagance with respect to emolument.²⁷⁹ This shows that, just as *jian* involves being appropriately conservative in expenditure as opposed to extravagance, *gong* has to do with a serious posture as opposed to *jiao*, which involves taking things lightly. It involves one's viewing what is at issue as demanding one's serious attention, whether the persons with whom one interacts, the spirits, one's official responsibilities, Heaven's punishment that one executes, or the Way that one reflects on. One gives serious attention to the way one proceeds outwardly, including one's demeanor and appearance when interacting with others as well as the way one proceeds and carries oneself in general. That *gong* has to do with such a posture of seriousness is reflected in its association with two terms with similar connotations, *su* 肅²⁸⁰ and *yan* 嚴.²⁸¹

The term *zhuang* 莊 takes this seriousness further. Like *gong*, it is often used in association with *jing* and in the combination *zhuang jing*²⁸², which sometimes occurs alongside *gong*.²⁸³ The use of *zhuang* exhibits several similarities to *gong*. For example, it characterizes one's demeanor and appearance (*se* 色²⁸⁴, *rong mao* 容貌²⁸⁵, or *wai mao* 外貌²⁸⁶) as well as one's movements and conduct²⁸⁷, including in one's own home.²⁸⁸ Like *gong*, *zhuang* is a matter not just of outward appearance but of the heart/mind²⁸⁹; one should have such a heart/mind as one prepares for sacrifices.²⁹⁰ It is also associated with *su*; the *Xunzi* comments on how music characterized by *su zhuang* 肅莊 can contribute to orderliness²⁹¹ and how proper music can bring about a heart/mind characterized by *zhuang*.²⁹²

There are two differences between *zhuang* and *gong*. First, by contrast to *gong*, *zhuang* is more frequently associated with *yan*, as seen from the combination *yan zhuang* 嚴莊²⁹³ and the association of *zhuang jing* 莊敬 with *yan wei* 嚴威²⁹⁴. *Yan* connotes a deep sense of seriousness explained in terms of “solidifying what is within and making upright what is without” (*jian zhong zheng wai* 堅中正外).²⁹⁵ One's concern is with ensuring not just that everything is outwardly proper, but also that the proper posture is inwardly and fully present. That is, one not only takes other individuals and one's responsibilities seriously, but also takes seriously one's having such a serious posture. This adds to the sense of “heaviness” that accompanies such seriousness, warranting the description in terms of a sense of gravity.

Second, *zhuang* in addition emphasizes the awe-inspiring effect of this sense of gravity, as seen from the combination *wei zhuang* 威莊.²⁹⁶ The posture *yan zhuang* 嚴莊 leads to *wei* 威²⁹⁷, and *zhuang jing* 莊敬, which is contrasted with a heart/mind lacking in seriousness (*yi man zhi xin* 易慢之心), leads to *yan wei* 嚴威.²⁹⁸ The point can be seen in other contexts. For

example, approaching the people with *zhuang* results in *jing* from the people²⁹⁹ while doing so without *zhuang* results in the opposite.³⁰⁰ *Yan zhuang* leads the people to view one with awe (*wei* 畏)³⁰¹ while the absence of *zhuang* results in one's subordinates taking one lightly.³⁰² Thus, *zhuang* is like *gong* in having to do with a posture of seriousness, but to an extent that carries a sense of gravity with an accompanying awe-inspiring effect.

Turning to *wei* 畏, while it is a response to *yan zhuang* as well as to *yan*³⁰³ and often to *wei* 威³⁰⁴, it is also a posture that accompanies (rather than as a response to) *yan gong*³⁰⁵, *gong jing*³⁰⁶, and *jing*.³⁰⁷ As such, it also takes the posture of seriousness involved in *gong* further. *Wei* 畏 is often directed to something positively valued, such as righteousness³⁰⁸, models and guidelines³⁰⁹, the good ruler³¹⁰, Heaven³¹¹, and the Mandate of Heaven along with the great person and words of the sages.³¹² When directed to Heaven or a human person, it is described as a response to the awe-inspiring quality (*wei* 威) of its object, such as Heaven³¹³, the ruler³¹⁴ and the superior person.³¹⁵ Even when directed to other objects such as righteousness, it involves one's being positively impressed by and looking up to that object, with a sense of submission to it. This usage of *wei* can be combined with other favorable orientations toward its object. For example, the successful ruler is such that his officials³¹⁶ as well as the people³¹⁷ will both *wei* and love him, while other states will cherish his beneficence and *wei* his prestige.³¹⁸

But, like the English word "awe", *wei* can also be associated with a negative view of its object that is akin to fear. The co-presence of both positive and negative aspects can be explained by the fact that one can respond to something of towering impressiveness differently depending on perspective. When confronting thunder and lightning, one might be positively impressed and struck with a sense of wonder as a mere spectator, but will feel fear if one sees oneself as potentially endangered. *Wei* in its negative aspect can be directed to a variety of objects, such as

people's gossip about oneself³¹⁹, death³²⁰, criminal verdict³²¹, punishment³²², a powerful official³²³, or a strong opposing army.³²⁴ In this usage, *wei* is closely associated with *ju*³²⁵ and *kong*.³²⁶

It is in its first usage that *wei* describes a posture that accompanies *gong* and *jing*, involving one's being favorably impressed by and looking up to some object. Such a posture differs from the first dimension of humility, which involves a deflated self-conception that is directed against the human tendency to elevate oneself over others and at competitiveness, one that emphasizes awareness of one's own limitations and a view of oneself as lower. By contrast, *wei* emphasizes the impressiveness of its object and a sense of submission to it. The comparison involved is not of the same level – one sees the object of *wei* as belonging to a different order to which one feels a sense of submission.

VI. JING AND HUMILITY

In sections 3 to 5, we discussed three dimensions of humility comprising traits opposed to the varieties of pride discussed in section 2. In this final section, we consider the term *jing* 敬, which encompasses all three dimensions.

Jing can be directed to some superhuman or human object, and qualifies the way one interacts with it. It can be directed to Heaven³²⁷ or the spirits³²⁸, and qualifies the way one serves the lord-on-high and the spirits³²⁹ or engages in sacrifices.³³⁰ It can be directed to the ruler³³¹ or parents³³², and qualifies the way one serves the ruler³³³ or parents.³³⁴ It can be directed to elders or others standing in special social relations to oneself³³⁵ as well as to human beings in general.³³⁶ In this connection, *jing* is still closely related to one's activities. A ruler's *jing* in

relation to people (of the upper class) is primarily a matter of his policies³³⁷ and dedication to governmental affairs³³⁸, and *jing* in relation to the common people concerns deploying their labor³³⁹ in a way like conducting an important sacrifice.³⁴⁰

Jing can also be directed to an object that is neither superhuman nor human and that is positively viewed or carries significance in itself, and qualifies what one does in relation to that object. For example, it can be directed to virtue³⁴¹ and qualifies the way one makes luminous one's virtue.³⁴² It can be directed to one's own person (*shen* 身) and qualifies the way one conducts one's own person³⁴³, which reflects on oneself and one's parents.³⁴⁴ It can be directed to righteousness³⁴⁵ and qualifies the way one abides by it³⁴⁶, to a ruler's decrees³⁴⁷ or one's responsibilities³⁴⁸ and qualifies the way one implements the decrees³⁴⁹ or responsibilities.³⁵⁰ Other examples include *jing* directed to one's comportment³⁵¹, models and guidelines³⁵², social divisions³⁵³, and one's work.³⁵⁴ *Jing* can also be directed to some activity of significance in itself, such as learning³⁵⁵ and teaching³⁵⁶, and can qualify activities of various kinds, such as the way one conducts oneself³⁵⁷, listens to an ode³⁵⁸, continues the way of Yao³⁵⁹, carries out instructions³⁶⁰, and imposes punishment.³⁶¹

Finally, *jing* can refer to an overall posture of a person as such, without being directed to any specific object or activity. For example, one might be urged to be *jing* or to practice *jing*³⁶², to make *jing* one's resting place³⁶³, to dwell in *jing*³⁶⁴, and to practice *jing* day and night.³⁶⁵ The *Lunyu* describes the superior person as *jing* without being amiss in anything³⁶⁶ and as someone who cultivates himself to achieve *jing*³⁶⁷, while the *Yijing* presents *jing* as something that one practices so as to straighten oneself on the inside.³⁶⁸ As an overall posture of a person, *jing* approximates humility in the broad sense, encompassing all its three dimensions.

In regard to the first dimension, *jing*³⁶⁹ and *gong jing*³⁷⁰ are related to *rang*, often occurring in the combination *jing rang*.³⁷¹ *Jing* is the spirit behind the rites³⁷², which as we saw involves lowering oneself and elevating others, and *jing* itself is directly related to viewing others as “higher” (*zun* 尊)³⁷³ and oneself as “lower” (*bei* 卑).³⁷⁴ In addition, the rites are also related to *qian*³⁷⁵, *rang*³⁷⁶, *bei*³⁷⁷, and *bei rang*.³⁷⁸

In regard to the second dimension, *jing* occurs in the combinations *jing ju*³⁷⁹, *jing jie*³⁸⁰, and *jing shen*.³⁸¹ It is contrasted with a causal³⁸², lax³⁸³, and playful or idle³⁸⁴ attitude, and is separately related to *jie*³⁸⁵ and especially *shen*.³⁸⁶

In regard to the third dimension, *jing* is frequently associated with *gong*³⁸⁷ and used in the combination *gong jing*.³⁸⁸ It is also associated with *wei* 畏³⁸⁹ and with *zhuang* in the combination *zhuang jing*.³⁹⁰ Both *wei* and *jing* can be directed to the same objects, such as the worthy person³⁹¹ or decrees and guidelines³⁹², and the two terms occur in the combination *wei jing* 畏敬.³⁹³

We saw earlier that *jing* is closely related to one’s activities. Even when directed to some superhuman, human, or non-human object, *jing* is not just a matter of the way one views the object, but concerns how one proceeds in activities related to that object. To better understand how the three dimensions of humility come together in *jing*, let us therefore consider *jing* in the context of one’s activities in an area of life of significance. To give concrete substance to the discussion, let us consider as example the study of classical texts, which Confucian thinkers believe should be approached with *jing*. The discussion of this example is intended to apply not just to the Confucians’ study of the canonical texts, but also our own contemporary study of the Chinese classics.

In regard to the first dimension, one's primary concern is with the study as such, not with the favorable opinion of others. One does not deliberately draw attention to one's abilities and accomplishments nor put on an exaggerated or false display of such. One does not exhibit a pattern of thinking of oneself as being above others, whether consciously comparative or otherwise, and is non-competitive. Instead, one works with an acute awareness of one's own limitations and is ready to acknowledge one's errors, others' accomplishments, as well as one's debt to others' past work. It is not problematic to have awareness of one's own merits, but one does not form an "inflated" self-conception that involves a pattern of consciously thinking to such merits. Instead, one works with a "deflated" self-conception that involves seeing oneself as part of a larger community of inquiry, focusing on one's contribution to advancing the inquiry with minimal concern for gains for oneself.

In regard to the second dimension, because one's concern is with advancing the inquiry as such, not with quick results for personal gains, one would approach the inquiry with caution and fearfulness. On the one hand, one aims at conclusions that are well-grounded, paying careful attention to the textual evidence and their fine details. On the other hand, one is constantly on guard against errors, not just in one's conclusions but in relation to subtle psychological dynamics that might skew one's conclusions, such as the tendency to force the evidence to fit in with one's preconceptions.

In regard to the third dimension, one gives serious attention to details in the inquiry to ensure that one's conclusions are fully substantiated by the evidence. At the same time, one also takes seriously the overall approach to the inquiry as such – in our contemporary terms, the methodological approach – to ensure that it is appropriate to the goals of the inquiry. In addition, one conducts the inquiry with the sense that one is responding to something "larger" that draws

one and demands one's attention. Part of this is the sense of overall progress, the sense that one is not just coming up with new or different conclusions, but making genuine advances in understanding and approximating some ideal limit that draws one. Another part is the sense of the boundlessness of the inquiry – there is no limit to the advances one can make in a specific area nor limit to the scope of inquiry with the multiplicities of ideas and connections between ideas awaiting exploration. This is not a source of stress since what occupies one's attention is not the demands on one's time, effort and labor, but a source of joy since what captures one's attention is the boundlessness of the world of learning that is open to one's endless exploration for a lifetime. In the case of the Confucians' study of the canonical texts, the sentiment also involves their sense that they are listening to the voices of the past sages via these texts.

A similar account can be provided for other Confucian examples, such as the posture of an official toward his governmental responsibilities. Ultimately, for the Confucians, *jing* is a posture toward one's life as such, a posture that involves one's seeing one's life as part of a larger ethical whole – one works with a deflated self-conception in all areas of life, exercises ethical caution and fearfulness in the way one conducts oneself, taking seriously this approach to life and at the same time being uplifted by the sense of participation in the Way. This posture of humility, encompassing all its three dimensions and not tied to any specific activity or area of life, is the overall posture that constitutes *jing* as a quality of the superior person.³⁹⁴

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, BERKELEY

REFERENCES

(1) Sinological Series

SBBY *Sibubeiyao* 四部備要 (Taipei: Taiwan Zhonghua Shuju 臺灣中華書局).

SKQS *Wenyuange Sikuquanshu* (Intranet ver.) 文淵閣四庫全書內聯網版 (Hong Kong: Digital Heritage Publishing 迪志文化出版).

(2) Texts

Guanzi 管子 (SBBY edition).

Guoyu 國語 (SBBY edition).

Hanfeizi 韓非子 (SBBY edition).

Huainanzi 淮南子 (SBBY edition).

Laozi 老子 (SBBY edition). References include page and passage numbers.

Liezi 列子 (SBBY edition).

Liji 禮記 (SBBY edition).

Lunyu 論語. References follow the numbering of passages in Yang Bojun 楊伯峻, *Lunyu Yizhu* 論語譯注 2nd edition (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju 中華書局, 1980).

Lushichunqiu 呂氏春秋 (SKQS edition).

Mengzi 孟子. References follow the numbering of passages, with book numbers 1A-7B substituted for 1-14, in Yang Bojun 楊伯峻, *Mengzi Yizhu* 孟子譯注 2nd edition (Beijing: Zhunghua Shuju 中華書局, 1984).

Mozi 墨子 (SKQS edition).

Shangshu 尚書. References are by page numbers to James Legge, trans., *The Chinese Classics*,

Volume III: The Shoo King. Reprint. (Taipei 臺北: Southern Materials Center, Inc. 南天書局有限公司, 1985).

Shenzi 慎子 (SBBY edition).

Shijing 詩經. References follow the ode and section numbers in Yang Renzhi 楊任之, *Shijing*

Jinyi Jinzhu 詩經今譯今注 (Tianjin: Tianjin Guji Chubanshe 天津古籍出版社, 1986).

Wang Yangming 王陽明 *Chuanxilu* 傳習錄. References follow the numbering of passages in

Chan Wing-tsit 陳榮捷, *Wang Yangming Chuanxilu Xiangzhu Jiping* 王陽明傳習錄詳註集評 (Taipei: Xuesheng Shuju 學生書局, 1983).

Xiaojing 孝經 in *Xiaojing Zhushu* 孝經注疏 (SBBY edition).

Xunzi 荀子 (SBBY edition).

Yijing 易經 in *Zhouyi Wang-Han Zhu* 周易王韓注 (SBBY edition).

Zhuangzi 莊子 (SBBY edition).

Zuozhuan 左傳 in *Chunqiu Zuoshizhuan Dushijijie* 春秋左氏傳杜氏集解 (SBBY edition)

ENDNOTES

¹ *Chuanxilu* 《傳習錄》 no. 339.

² *Xunzi* 《荀子》 2.2b; *Lushichunqiu* 《呂氏春秋》 15.9a.

³ *Shenzi* 《慎子》 7b; *Hanfeizi* 《韓非子》 15.6b.

⁴ *Laozi* 《老子》 1.17b, no. 30.

⁵ *Zhuangzi* 《莊子》 8.17a.

⁶ *Shangshu* 《尚書》 575.

⁷ *Guoyu* 《國語》 12.5b, 14.12a; *Liji* 《禮記》 19.15a.

⁸ *Guanzi* 《管子》 5.13b, 17.8b.

⁹ *Guanzi* 20.11b; *Xiaojing* 《孝經》 2.1a.

¹⁰ *Guanzi* 4.6b.

¹¹ *Shangshu* 60.

¹² *Guoyu* 21.1a.

-
- ¹³ *Lunyu* 《論語》 7. 26.
¹⁴ *Xunzi* 2.2a.
¹⁵ *Xunzi* 3.11a.
¹⁶ *Zuozhuan* 《左傳》 15.14a-14b.
¹⁷ *Guanzi* 13.9b; *Liji* 1.3a.
¹⁸ *Yijing* 《易經》 2.6a.
¹⁹ *Yijing* 9.5a.
²⁰ *Yijing* 2.5b.
²¹ *Shangshu* 65.
²² *Xunzi* 3.16a-16b, 20.1a-1b.
²³ *Xunzi* 3.16a-16b.
²⁴ *Guanzi* 11.10a.
²⁵ *Guanzi* 17.8b.
²⁶ *Guoyu* 12.1a-1b.
²⁷ *Liji* 16.1a.
²⁸ *Shangshu* 532-533; *Huainanzi* 《淮南子》 9.15b.
²⁹ *Guanzi* 11.15a.
³⁰ *Liji* 14.26a, *Yijing* 7.6a.
³¹ *Yijing* 7.6a.
³² *Shangshu* 15.
³³ *Xunzi* 2.2a.
³⁴ *Xunzi* 8.2b.
³⁵ *Liji* 17.1a.
³⁶ *Xunzi* 2.2a.
³⁷ *Xunzi* 4.10b.
³⁸ *Shangshu* 466.
³⁹ *Guanzi* 20.10b.
⁴⁰ *Lunyu* 13: 26, cf. 20: 2.
⁴¹ *Mengzi* 《孟子》 3B:4.
⁴² *Hanfeizi* 2.8b, 12.6a.
⁴³ *Xunzi* 7.11b, *Laozi* 1.17a, no. 29.
⁴⁴ *Zuozhuan* 19.16a; *Guoyu* 2.12a; *Hanfeizi* 12.9a, 18.4a-4b; *Guanzi* 5.3a, 5.13b.
⁴⁵ *Xunzi* 6.4a.
⁴⁶ *Lunyu* 7: 26.
⁴⁷ *Guoyu* 12.5b, 14.12a; *Liji* 19.15a.
⁴⁸ *Lunyu* 20: 2.
⁴⁹ *Lunyu* 1: 15, 14: 10.
⁵⁰ *Laozi* 1.5a, no. 9; *Hanfeizi* 6.3a-3b.
⁵¹ *Shangshu* 532-533; *Guoyu* 18.10a; *Xunzi* 3.11a; *Liji* 16.12b; *Yijing* 1.3a; *Xiaoqing* 2.1a, 6.1b.
⁵² *Zuozhuan* 11.5b, 28.8a.
⁵³ *Zuozhuan* 1.10b.
⁵⁴ *Zuozhuan* 13.25a; *Guoyu* 16.3b.
⁵⁵ *Shangshu* 575; *Zuozhuan* 1.10b.
⁵⁶ *Zuozhuan* 12.20b.
⁵⁷ *Guoyu* 16.1b.
⁵⁸ *Guanzi* 5.13b.
⁵⁹ *Guoyu* 2.6b.
⁶⁰ *Guoyu* 16.1b; *Xunzi* 12.12b.
⁶¹ *Xunzi* 3.11a.
⁶² *Hanfeizi* 15.3a.
⁶³ *Hanfeizi* 18.9a.
⁶⁴ *Hanfeizi* 15.4b, 15.5a.

-
- 65 *Guanzi* 5.13b.
66 *Zhuangzi* 8.17a.
67 *Guoyu* 2.6b.
68 *Hanfeizi* 5.4b.
69 *Guanzi* 5.13b.
70 *Zuozhuan* 23.23a.
71 *Xunzi* 2.9b, 4.10b; *Hanfeizi* 5.4b; *Guanzi* 10.12a.
72 *Mengzi* 2A:4.
73 *Liji* 15.4a.
74 *Xunzi* 11.7b.
75 *Zuozhuan* 18.22a-22b.
76 *Liji* 19.11b.
77 *Zhuangzi* 10.6b.
78 *Hanfeizi* 18.5b.
79 *Huainanzi* 11.13a.
80 *Xunzi* 1.5a.
81 *Xunzi* 1.6a.
82 *Hanfeizi* 10.6a.
83 *Hanfeizi* 7.7a.
84 *Xunzi* 2.2a.
85 *Zhuangzi* 8.17a.
86 *Xunzi* 2.6a.
87 *Liezi* 《列子》 7.6a.
88 *Lushichunqiu* 1.7b.
89 *Shangshu* 60; *Xunzi* 16.7a; *Hanfeizi* 17.8b; *Guanzi* 4.4a; *Laozi* 1.12b, no. 22; 1.13b, no. 24, 1.17b, no. 30.
90 *Guanzi* 5.11a; *Huananzi* 13.4a.
91 *Shangshu* 60; *Mozi* 1.4a, 5.5a; *Guanzi* 4.4a, 20.9b; *Lao* 1.12b, no. 22; 1.13b, no. 24; *Zhuangzi* 7.11b.
92 *Xunzi* 3.17a, 16.7a.
93 *Hanfeizi* 17.8b.
94 *Xunzi* 20.7b.
95 *Guanzi* 21.13b; *Zhuangzi* 7.11b.
96 *Mozi* 《墨子》 5.5a.
97 *Mozi* 1.4a.
98 *Xunzi* 3.17a, 16.6b-7a, 20.11b.
99 *Liezi* 1.12b.
100 *Xunzi* 16.7a.
101 *Guanzi* 5.11a.
102 *Huainanzi* 13.4a.
103 *Shangshu* 60, cf. 257.
104 *Xunzi* 16.7a.
105 *Hanfeizi* 15.6b.
106 *Hanfeizi* 17.8b.
107 *Huainanzi* 13.7a.
108 *Hanfeizi* 15.3b, 15.6b; *Huainanzi* 11.2b, 11.15b.
109 *Guoyu* 2.14b.
110 *Zuozhuan* 20.14a; *Guoyu* 3.2a, 15.7a.
111 *Guoyu* 19.2b; *Hanfeizi* 5.1b.
112 *Guoyu* 18.9b.
113 *Laozi* 1.12b, no. 22; 1.13b, no. 24.
114 *Zhuangzi* 10.5a.
115 *Lunyu* 7: 26.
116 *Guoyu* 21.1a.

-
- 117 *Shangshu* 182.
118 *Shangshu* 60.
119 *Xunzi* 3.16a-16b.
120 *Xunzi* 2.2a; *Huainanzi* 10.13a, 15.16b.
121 *Guanzi* 20.11b; *Huainanzi* 13.20a; *Xiaojing* 2.1a.
122 *Guoyu* 21.1a.
123 *Guanzi* 20.11b.
124 *Xunzi* 20.1a-1b.
125 *Huainanzi* 10.2a.
126 *Lunyu* 8: 5.
127 *Xunzi* 3.16b.
128 *Liji* 11.25b.
129 *Yijing* 8.6b-7a.
130 *Shangzhu* 65.
131 *Yijing* 9.5a.
132 *Yijing* 2.5b.
133 *Yijing* 2.5b, 2.6a.
134 *Zhuangzi* 10.18b.
135 *Yijing* 7.6a.
136 *Shangshu* 87; *Guoyu* 10.17b-18a.
137 *Zuozhuan* 22.9a.
138 *Guoyu* 3.9b-10b.
139 *Zuozhuan* 15.14a-14b.
140 *Zuozhuan* 8.3b.
141 *Zuozhuan* 20.18b-19a.
142 *Shangshu* 533; *Guoyu* 10.17b-18a, 15.5b.
143 *Liji* 20.5a.
144 *Liji* 20.14b.
145 *Xunzi* 14.3b.
146 *Zuozhuan* 25.10a.
147 *Zuozhuan* 22.9a; *Xunzi* 2.8a.
148 *Liji* 7.7b.
149 *Liji* 11.26a.
150 *Guoyu* 2.7a.
151 *Guoyu* 2.14b.
152 *Zuozhuan* 15.14a-14b.
153 *Xunzi* 3.11a.
154 *Guanzi* 13.9b; *Liji* 1.3a.
155 *Liji* 1.3a, 17.5a.
156 *Liji* 1.3a.
157 *Liji* 15.15b.
158 *Liji* 15.16b.
159 *Zuozhuan* 11.2a; *Lunyu* 12: 20.
160 *Zhuangzi* 9.16b.
161 *Hanfeizi* 3.9a.
162 *Hanfeizi* 16.4b-5a.
163 *Lushichunqiu* 11.4b.
164 *Lushichunqiu* 15.2a.
165 *Guoyu* 3.1b, 5.2b.
166 *Lunyu* 4: 21.
167 *Mengzi* 3B:9.
168 *Guoyu* 14.9a, 15.7b, 17.10b.
169 *Zuozhuan* 2.3a-3b.

-
- 170 *Guanzi* 9.1b.
171 *Guanzi* 16.9a-9b.
172 *Guoyu* 15.4b; *Hanfeizi* 2.16a-16b.
173 *Xunzi* 1.12b.
174 *Liji* 1.5a.
175 *Guoyu* 15.4b; *Lunyu* 4: 21; *Mozi* 2.11a.
176 *Lunshichunqiu* 15.2a.
177 *Shangshu* 184, 287, 466, 588.
178 *Lushichunqiu* 15.1a-1b.
179 *Shangshu* 466.
180 *Lunyu* 7: 11.
181 *Xunzi* 15.10a.
182 *Shijing* 《詩經》 201/1, 201/2; *Lushichunqiu* 3.10a, 15.1a-1b.
183 *Zuozhuan* 13.6b; *Guoyu* 19.3a; *Xunzi* 1.10b, 3.15a-15b, 7.5a, 8.2a; *Lushichunqiu* 18.4b; *Hanfeizi* 2.16b; *Liji* 16.1a, 19.11a.
184 *Guoyu* 1.14a.
185 *Zhuangzi* 6.15a.
186 *Guoyu* 7.10a.
187 *Guoyu* 9.5a.
188 *Guoyu* 19.5b-6a.
189 *Guanzi* 1.17a, 5.10b, cf. 1.2a-2b.
190 *Huainanzi* 2.4b; *Xunzi* 16.10b.
191 *Xiaojing* 8.1b.
192 *Zuozhuan* 13.26b.
193 *Hanfeizi* 7.9a.
194 *Guanzi* 5.10b.
195 *Xunzi* 16.10b, 20.8b.
196 *Lushichunqiu* 15.1a-1b.
197 *Guanzi* 17.8b.
198 *Shangshu* 250.
199 *Hanfeizi* 7.7a.
200 *Guanzi* 24.18a.
201 *Huainanzi* 12.17a.
202 *Mengzi* 7B:37.
203 *Zuozhuan* 18.27b.
204 *Lunyu* 8: 17.
205 *Liji* 15.20b-21a.
206 *Xunzi* 11.12a; *Liji* 5.4a, 5.9a, 5.20a.
207 *Zuozhuan* 13.26b.
208 *Shangshu* 213.
209 *Lunyu* 16: 7.
210 *Zhuangzi* 2.9a.
211 *Shangshu* 54-55, 157, 201, 539.
212 *Shangshu* 532; *Shijing* 263/2; *Zuozhuan* 13.14a, 29.19a; *Mozi* 7.1a-1b, 7.12b; *Mengzi* 3B:2; *Zhuangzi* 7.4a; *Liezi* 8.10a; *Liji* 8.7b.
213 *Xunzi* 19.4b.
214 *Guoyu* 19.10a-10b.
215 *Guoyu* 12.1a-1b.
216 *Xunzi* 18.5b.
217 *Hanfeizi* 1.4b.
218 *Zhuangzi* 8.17a.
219 *Guoyu* 13.6a-6b; *Hanfeizi* 15.5a-5b.

-
- 220 *Guoyu* 9.1a.
221 *Guoyu* 11.2b-3a.
222 *Zuozhuan* 2.3a-3b; *Guoyu* 1.14a, 3.2a, 17.1a-1b.
223 *Mozi* 7.1a-1b, 7.12b.
224 *Mozi* 7.12b; *Liji* 1.15b, 16.1a.
225 *Shangshu* 62, 78.
226 *Shangshu* 576-577.
227 *Zuozhuan* 21.24a; *Guanzi* 3.16a; cf. *Liji* 19.13a.
228 *Shangshu* 531; *Guanzi* 6.8a.
229 *Zuozhuan* 19.5a; *Xunzi* 19.14a; *Hanfeizi* 12.9b, 17.7b; cf. *Shangshu* 213.
230 *Liji* 6.18b.
231 *Liji* 11.4b.
232 *Shangshu* 381, 498; *Zuozhuan* 12.9a, *Yijing* 6.2b.
233 *Liji* 7.21a, 11.7a.
234 *Liji* 15.9a.
235 *Mengzi* 2A:7.
236 *Zuozhuan* 8.8b.
237 *Mozi* 1.4b.
238 *Liji* 14.13b.
239 *Shijing* 200/3; *Lunyu* 1: 14, 2: 18, 19: 25; *Guanzi* 4.4b; *Yijing* 3.8a, 7.5b; *Hanfeizi* 13.6a.
240 *Lunyu* 2: 18; *Yijing* 7.5b; *Hanfeizi* 13.6a; *Xiaojing* 8.1b; *Liji* 19.5a.
241 *Shangshu* 183, 210-211; *Lunyu* 1.9; *Liji* 6.23a.
242 *Xunzi* 2.4b; *Liji* 7.16a, 16.1a, 19.9b.
243 *Shangshu* 161, 202, 346; *Liji* 19.13b.
244 *Shangshu* 613.
245 *Liji* 5.17b.
246 *Xunzi* 16.11b.
247 *Xunzi* 14.2b.
248 *Lushichunqiu* 15.1a-1b.
249 *LushiChunqiu* 10.4b.
250 *Liji* 16.9b.
251 *Liji* 17.9a.
252 *Lunyu* 19: 25.
253 *Mengzi* 2A:7.
254 *Xunzi* 2.6a.
255 *Huainanzi* 9.20b.
256 *Shangshu* 208.
257 *Liji* 17.12a.
258 *Shangshu* 433.
259 *Liji* 1.8a.
260 *Liji* 10.18a.
261 *Shijing* 258/6; *Guoyu* 1.9a, 18.1b.
262 *Shangshu* 231.
263 *Shangshu* 153-155, 304, cf. 296.
264 *Shangshu* 250.
265 *Lunyu* 5: 16.
266 *Guoyu* 14.5b; *Lunyu* 13: 19.
267 *Shangshu* 326-327; *Lunyu* 16: 10.
268 *Xunzi* 1.12b.
269 *Liji* 9.13b.
270 *Lunyu* 15: 5.
271 *Lunyu* 12: 5; *Xunzi* 1.6a, 17.8b, 20.17b; *Liji* 17.4a; *Yijing* 7.6a.
272 *Lunyu* 17: 6; *Mengzi* 4A:16.

-
- ²⁷³ *Mengzi* 5B:4.
²⁷⁴ *Mengzi* 4A:16.
²⁷⁵ *Mengzi* 6A:6.
²⁷⁶ *Mengzi* 7A:37.
²⁷⁷ *Shangshu* 532-533; *Mengzi* 3A:3; *Xunzi* 2.6b, 11.7a; *Liji* 15.1a, 15.1b, 17.5a.
²⁷⁸ *Mengzi* 4A:16; *Xunzi* 4.7b, *Xunzi* 17.8b; *Liji* 17.11a.
²⁷⁹ *Shangshu* 532-533.
²⁸⁰ *Shangshu* 326-327, 378; *Guoyu* 1.9a.
²⁸¹ *Shangshu* 466.
²⁸² *Liji* 11.23a-23b, 14.12b, 17.1b.
²⁸³ *Liji* 11.1a, 15.1a, 15.1b.
²⁸⁴ *Lunyu* 11: 21.
²⁸⁵ *Xunzi* 14.1b; *Liji* 11.24b.
²⁸⁶ *Liji* 11.23a-23b, 14.12b.
²⁸⁷ *Guanzi* 20.10a.
²⁸⁸ *Liji* 14.13b.
²⁸⁹ *Liji* 17.16a.
²⁹⁰ *Liji* 14.17b.
²⁹¹ *Xunzi* 14.2a.
²⁹² *Xunzi* 14.2b.
²⁹³ *Guanzi* 20.10b.
²⁹⁴ *Liji* 11.23a, 14.12b.
²⁹⁵ *Guanzi* 16.9b.
²⁹⁶ *Liji* 17.6a.
²⁹⁷ *Guanzi* 20.10b.
²⁹⁸ *Liji* 11.23a-23b, 14.12b.
²⁹⁹ *Lunyu* 2: 20.
³⁰⁰ *Lunyu* 15: 33.
³⁰¹ *Guanzi* 20.10b, cf. 16.9b.
³⁰² *Guanzi* 20.10a.
³⁰³ *Guanzi* 16.9b.
³⁰⁴ *Shijing* 272/1; *Zuozhuan* 2.24b, 8.9b, 9.12a-12b, 19.23b-24b; *Lunyu* 20: 2; *Mengzi* 1B:3.
³⁰⁵ *Shangshu* 466.
³⁰⁶ *Xunzi* 2.2a.
³⁰⁷ *Zuozhuan* 15.23a, 20.5b; *Xunzi* 2.2a; *Liji* 1.1a, 1.18a.
³⁰⁸ *Xunzi* 2.3a; *Liji* 17.5a, 17.7b; cf. *Yijing* 8.4b.
³⁰⁹ *Xunzi* 4.10b, 7.14a-14b.
³¹⁰ *Zuozhuan* 15.23a.
³¹¹ *Mengzi* 1B:3.
³¹² *Lunyu* 16: 8.
³¹³ *Shijing* 272/1; *Zuozhuan* 8.9b, 9.12a-12b, *Mengzi* 1B:3.
³¹⁴ *Zuozhuan* 2.24b, 19.23b-24b.
³¹⁵ *Lunyu* 20: 2; cf. *Liji* 17.1a.
³¹⁶ *Zuozhuan* 19.23b-24b.
³¹⁷ *Xiaoqing* 5.4b; cf. *Guanzi* 20.10b.
³¹⁸ *Guoyu* 1.2b, 14.1b; *Guanzi* 10.2a.
³¹⁹ *Shijing* 76/3; cf. *Guoyu* 10.2b.
³²⁰ *Hanfeizi* 4.5a.
³²¹ *Guanzi* 15.14a; *Liji* 17.2b.
³²² *Zuozhuan* 5.29a, 25.11a; *Guanzi* 15.5a; *Hanfeizi* 1.12a, 2.6a, 4.16a-16b.
³²³ *Hanfeizi* 2.6a, 10.7b-8a, 14.3b.
³²⁴ *Guoyu* 19.2b; *Zuozhuan* 1.14b; *Hanfeizi* 2.16b.
³²⁵ *Guanzi* 2.8a, 21.5b; *Laozi* 2.21b, no. 74.

-
- ³²⁶ *Xunzi* 5.1b, 6.7a; *Guanzi* 1.17a, 21.9b; *Hanfeizi* 6.3a.
³²⁷ *Shangshu* 284.
³²⁸ *Shijing* 258/6; *Guoyu* 18.1b; *Lunyu* 6: 22; *Liji* 1.18a.
³²⁹ *Guoyu* 1.13b.
³³⁰ *Zuozhuan* 9.11a; *Xunzi* 13.11b-12a; *Liji* 10.18a, 14.25a.
³³¹ *Mengzi* 2B:2, 4A:2.
³³² *Xiaojing* 1.3a.
³³³ *Guoyu* 6.3a, 7.6a.
³³⁴ *Liji* 14.6a.
³³⁵ *Zuozhuan* 7.21; *Guoyu* 11.1a; *Mengzi* 6A:5, 6B:7, 7A:15.
³³⁶ *Mengzi* 4B:28.
³³⁷ *Guoyu* 6.4b.
³³⁸ *Guoyu* 3.10a.
³³⁹ *Lunyu* 2.20.
³⁴⁰ *Lunyu* 12: 2.
³⁴¹ *Shangshu* 209-210, 426-427, 429.
³⁴² *Shijing* 299/4.
³⁴³ *Liji* 14.13b.
³⁴⁴ *Shijing* 194/3, *Liji* 15.5b, 15.6a.
³⁴⁵ *Xunzi* 11.8a-8b.
³⁴⁶ *Liji* 8.10a.
³⁴⁷ *Guoyu* 1.15a-15b.
³⁴⁸ *Zuozhuan* 4.6b; *Lunyu* 1: 5, 15: 38, 16: 10; cf. *Shijing* 276/1.
³⁴⁹ *Guoyu* 2.11b.
³⁵⁰ *Zuozhuan* 14.6b; *Lunyu* 13: 19.
³⁵¹ *Shijing* 196/2, 253/3, 256/2, 256/5, 299/4.
³⁵² *Xunzi* 7.13b, 18.6b.
³⁵³ *Xunzi* 7.12a, 8.8a.
³⁵⁴ *Liji* 11.1b.
³⁵⁵ *Guoyu* 14.5b; *Liji* 11.5a.
³⁵⁶ *Zuozhuan* 4.8a.
³⁵⁷ *Guoyu* 3.9b-10b, *Lunyu* 15: 6.
³⁵⁸ *Shijing* 200/7.
³⁵⁹ *Mengzi* 5A:6.
³⁶⁰ *Shangshu* 581.
³⁶¹ *Shangshu* 388, 609.
³⁶² *Shangshu* 397, 489.
³⁶³ *Shangshu* 429.
³⁶⁴ *Lunyu* 6: 2.
³⁶⁵ *Shijing* 286/1, cf. 288/1.
³⁶⁶ *Lunyu* 12: 5.
³⁶⁷ *Lunyu* 14: 42.
³⁶⁸ *Yijing* 1.7a.
³⁶⁹ *Guoyu* 3.9b-10b.
³⁷⁰ *Mengzi* 2A:6 and 6A:6; *Xunzi* 13.2b; *Liji* 1.2b, *Guanzi* 3.17b.
³⁷¹ *Liji* 15.2b, 17.4a, 20.6b, 20.14b-15a; *Xiaojing* 3.3a.
³⁷² *Liji* 11.9b.
³⁷³ *Liji* 17.6a.
³⁷⁴ *Zuozhuan* 20.24a.
³⁷⁵ *Yijing* 8.6b-7a.
³⁷⁶ *Lunyu* 4: 13; *Zuozhuan* 15.14a-14b.
³⁷⁷ *Liji* 1.3a.
³⁷⁸ *Zuozhuan* 20.18b-19a.

³⁷⁹ *Mozi* 2.3a.

³⁸⁰ *Zuozhuan* 16.23a; *Guoyu* 17.1b-2a; *Xunzi* 19.4b.

³⁸¹ *Shijing* 253/3, 256/2, 299/4; *Zuozhuan* 19.23b, 20.19a; *Mozi* 8.4b; *Liji* 19.8a, 20.2b.

³⁸² *Xunzi* 10.7a-7b, 17.11a; *Liji* 11.23a-23b.

³⁸³ *Xunzi* 10.7a-7b, 19.4b.

³⁸⁴ *Shijing* 254/8.

³⁸⁵ *Shijing* 263/1; *Mengzi* 3B:2.

³⁸⁶ *Xunzi* 10.7a-7b, 13.6b; *Huainanzi* 18.13a; *Liji* 17.9a; cf. *Zuozhuan* 17.22a.

³⁸⁷ *Lunyu* 5: 16, 16: 10; *Liji* 10.18a.

³⁸⁸ *Mengzi* 6A:6, 7A:37; *Xunzi* 2.2a-2b.

³⁸⁹ *Zuozhuan* 15.23a, 20.5b; *Xunzi* 2.2a, 2.3a.

³⁹⁰ *Liji* 11.1a, 11.23a-23b, 14.12b, 15.1a-1b 17.1b.

³⁹¹ *Liji* 1.1a.

³⁹² cf. *Xunzi* 18.6b & *Liji* 1.18a.

³⁹³ *Liji* 19.11b.

³⁹⁴ I am indebted to an anonymous reviewer for helpful suggestions that I incorporated when revising an earlier version of this paper.