

**KWONG-LOI SHUN**

**DIMENSIONS OF HUMILITY IN EARLY CONFUCIAN THOUGHT**

**Journal of Chinese Philosophy 48 (2021): 13-27**

**Abstract**

Through an examination of the problematic forms of pride highlighted in early texts and the traits to which they are opposed, the paper identifies three main dimensions of humility in early Confucian thought. These include a deflated self-conception, caution and fearfulness, as well as seriousness and awe. It then shows that the term *jing* 敬 is closely related to all three dimensions, and hence that this is the term in early Confucian thought closest to encompassing all the different aspects of humility understood in a broad sense.

**I. PRIDE AND HUMILITY**

Wang Yangming (1472-1529) once comments:

“A great defect in life is *ao* 傲... One should not harbor any (self); to have (a self) is *ao* ... To be without a self (*wu wo* 無我) is *qian* 謙. *Qian* is the foundation of all goodness, and *ao* the chief of all evil.”<sup>1</sup>

The terms *ao* and *qian* are often translated as “pride” and “humility” respectively, but I have deliberately left the two terms untranslated. *Ao* is related to other terms, notably *jiao* 驕, referring to traits that can be described as problematic forms of pride, and *qian* related to other terms

referring to traits that can be described as different aspects of humility. I will reserve the use of “pride” and “humility” to refer to the broader phenomena that encompass these traits.

Wang’s interest in pride and humility is a continuation of a similar interest in early Confucian thought. In this paper, I will discuss the early Confucian understanding of pride and humility primarily through an examination of the relevant terms. Since the use of these terms is shared by other early thinkers, I will draw on the whole corpus of texts up to early Han, though with greater emphasis on texts with a Confucian orientation. After discussing the varieties of pride highlighted in these texts, I will identify three dimensions of humility comprising traits opposed to pride. I then conclude with a discussion of *jing* 敬, the term closest to encompassing all three dimensions. Thus, the paper is also an exploration of the Confucian understanding of *jing*.

This study will focus on four clusters of terms. The first includes those that convey various forms of pride. Aside from *jiao* and *ao*, there are several other related terms. For example, *jiao* is used in association with *kua* 夸<sup>2</sup>, *jin* 矜<sup>3</sup>, *jin* and *fa* 伐<sup>4</sup>, *fa* and *ao* 敖<sup>5</sup>, *jin* and *kua* 侔<sup>6</sup>, *tai* 泰 (in a problematic sense)<sup>7</sup>, *ao* 傲 and *tai*<sup>8</sup>. The first cluster includes:

1. *Tai* 泰, *jiao* 驕, *ao* 傲 (and *ao* 敖), *kua* 夸 (and *kua* 侔), *fa* 伐, *jin* 矜.

The second cluster includes terms related to the first dimension of humility, which I will label “deflated self-conception”. It has two sub-groups. The first includes:

- 2a. *Man* 滿, *ying* 盈, *yi* 溢.

*Man* and *ying* are used to convey traits similar or opposed to those in the first cluster, depending on context. *Man* is non-problematic when used in the context of being full without overflowing (*man er bu yi* 滿而不溢), a quality opposed to *jiao*<sup>9</sup>, but problematic when it involves viewing oneself as full, a phenomenon related to *jin*<sup>10</sup> as well as to *jin* and *fa*<sup>11</sup>. *Ying* is non-problematic

when used in the context of being full without overflowing (*ying ger bu yi* 盈而不溢), a quality opposed to *jiao* and *jin*<sup>12</sup>, but problematic when it involves viewing oneself as full when empty (*xu er wei ying* 虛而為盈)<sup>13</sup>. *Yi*, on the other hand, is usually problematic and is used in the combination *jiao yi* 驕溢<sup>14</sup>.

The second sub-group includes:

2b. *Qian* 謙, *rang* 讓, *bei* 卑.

*Rang* is contrasted with *jiao*<sup>15</sup> and *fa*<sup>16</sup> while *bei* is contrasted with *jiao*.<sup>17</sup> *Qian* is used in relation to *bei*<sup>18</sup>, *ying*<sup>19</sup>, *bei* and *ying*<sup>20</sup>, *man*<sup>21</sup>, *man* and *rang*<sup>22</sup>, and it is explicitly contrasted with *jiao ying*.<sup>23</sup>

The third cluster includes terms relate to the second dimension of humility, which I will label “caution and fearfulness”:

3. *Ju* 懼, *kong* 恐, *jie* 戒, *shen* 慎.

*Jiao* is contrasted with *ju*<sup>24</sup>, *kong*<sup>25</sup>, *jie*<sup>26</sup>, and these three terms are often used along with *shen*<sup>27</sup>.

The fourth cluster includes terms related to the third dimension of humility, which I will label “seriousness and awe”:

4. *Gong* 恭, *zhuang* 莊, and *wei* 畏.

*Gong* is contrasted with *jiao*<sup>28</sup>, *ao* 敖<sup>29</sup> and *fa*<sup>30</sup>, and is related to *qian*<sup>31</sup> and *rang*<sup>32</sup>. The combination *gong jing* 恭敬 is contrasted with *jiao* and *ao* 傲<sup>33</sup>, while *gong* and *jing* are separately contrasted with *jiao*<sup>34</sup>. *Zhuang* often occurs in combination with *jing* and is contrasted with *jin*<sup>35</sup>. In addition, *wei* is contrasted with *jiao*<sup>36</sup> and *ao* 傲<sup>37</sup>, is presented as a posture that accompanies *yan gong* 嚴恭<sup>38</sup> and a response to *yan zhuang* 嚴莊<sup>39</sup>.

We will discuss these four clusters in sections 2 to 5 respectively, concluding with a discussion of *jing* in section 6.

## II. PRIDE AND ITS VARIETIES

The term *tai* need not be problematic, as when the superior person is described as *tai* without being *jiao* (*tai er bu jiao* 泰而不驕).<sup>40</sup> It is problematic when referring to excessiveness<sup>41</sup>, in which case it is associated with terms with similar connotations, including *shen* 甚<sup>42</sup>, *she* 奢<sup>43</sup>, *chi* 侈<sup>44</sup>, and *yin* 淫<sup>45</sup>. It can also be problematic when one takes oneself to have much when one has little (*yue er wei tai* 約而為泰).<sup>46</sup> That *jiao* is often used with *tai* in the combination *jiao tai* 驕泰<sup>47</sup> shows that *jiao* also involves a problematic form of excessiveness. Just as being fierce is a problematic variation on being awe-inspiring, *jiao* is a problematic variation on *tai* in the sense of having plenty.<sup>48</sup>

*Jiao* can concern various areas of life, including wealth<sup>49</sup>, wealth and honor<sup>50</sup>, occupying a high position<sup>51</sup>, and military victory.<sup>52</sup> What renders *jiao* problematic is a conception of oneself as having plenty, in a way that adversely affects the way one approaches the relevant areas of life. One adverse effect is excessiveness, conveyed through *jiao*'s association with *she*<sup>53</sup>, *chi*<sup>54</sup> and *yin*<sup>55</sup>. Another adverse effect is laxity, conveyed through its association with *yi* 佚<sup>56</sup>, *dai man* 怠慢<sup>57</sup>, and *huan dai* 緩怠<sup>58</sup>; in the military context, one becomes lacking in strategy.<sup>59</sup> To reinforce this self-conception, *jiao* also leads to greed to acquire even more for oneself.<sup>60</sup>

This self-conception also leads to an adverse comparative judgment on others, as conveyed by the verbal use of *jiao* directed to people in general (*jiao ren* 驕人)<sup>61</sup> or those below

oneself (*jiao xia* 驕下).<sup>62</sup> One takes others lightly (*qing* 輕)<sup>63</sup>, resulting in insulting treatment as conveyed by the combinations *jiao wu* 驕侮<sup>64</sup> and *qing wu* 輕侮.<sup>65</sup> This disdainful attitude also manifests itself in one's demeanor and appearance (*se* 色)<sup>66</sup> and in one's violation of the rites (*li* 禮).<sup>67</sup>

The use of *ao* 傲 and its variant *ao* 敖 is often similar to *jiao*. Someone in a high position might be *ao* 傲<sup>68</sup> and direct this attitude toward those below.<sup>69</sup> It is related to extravagance<sup>70</sup> and to laxity, as reflected in the combinations *dai ao* 怠傲<sup>71</sup>, *dai ao* 怠敖<sup>72</sup>, *ao man* 傲慢<sup>73</sup>, *ao man* 敖慢<sup>74</sup>, *duo ao* 惰傲<sup>75</sup>, and *ao duo* 敖惰.<sup>76</sup> *Ao* 敖 also manifests itself in one's bearing (*rong* 容).<sup>77</sup>

Four considerations show that, while *jiao* involves a more conscious comparison with others, *ao* involves a conception of oneself as on a “high” level without similar conscious comparison. First, *ao* 傲 occurs more frequently in contexts that emphasize one's viewing oneself as in a “high” position as such, as reflected in the combination *gao ao* 高傲<sup>78</sup>, while *jiao* does not similarly occur. Second, *jiao* often involves one's taking others lightly (*qing* 輕), which implies a more conscious view of others as being “below” oneself, while this is not true of *ao*. *Ao* 敖 is on occasion used in association with *qing* when someone is described as “being above the world and taking worldly things lightly” (*ao shi qing wu* 敖世輕物)<sup>79</sup>, but the emphasis here is on aloofness rather than comparison with others. Third, while *jiao* is often associated with a deliberate slighting of others, *ao* 傲 is illustrated by examples reflecting one's view of one's “high” position without deliberately slighting others, such as giving unsought advice to others<sup>80</sup> or speaking to an unsuited audience about the Way.<sup>81</sup> In the military context, *ao* 傲 involves a

high opinion of one's military strength leading to fondness for warfare (*hao bing* 好兵)<sup>82</sup>, while *jiao* involves a more conscious comparison with opponents by taking them lightly (*qing di* 輕敵).<sup>83</sup> And fourth, when *jiao* is used alongside *ao* 傲 or *ao* 敖, it is often used verbally to refer to one's deliberately slighting others. For example, one takes an aloof position (*ju ao* 倨傲) so as to display one's superiority to others (*yi jiao yi ren* 以驕溢人)<sup>84</sup>, and demonstrates one's aloof position (*ao* 敖) by using one's airs to display one's superiority to others (*yi ru se jiao ren* 以汝色驕人).<sup>85</sup>

While *jiao* and *ao* both involve a conception of oneself as being above others, *kua* 夸 (and its variant *kua* 誇), *fa* 伐 and *jin* 衿 focus more on problematic ways of self-presentation. Of the three, *kua* more heavily emphasizes the blatant falsity of the appearance one puts up. The combination *kua dan* 夸誕 is used in parallel to what is faked and deceptive and contrasted with what is genuine and sincere.<sup>86</sup> Just as one disguises one's true nature in order to acquire a name (*zhao ming* 招名), one advocates morality in order to impress people (*kua ren* 夸人).<sup>87</sup> Another example is to decline wealth and honor in order to acquire the corresponding name (*kua yi ming* 夸以名).<sup>88</sup> Thus, *kua* primarily concerns putting on a false appearance to acquire a name.

*Fa* and *jin* are frequently used in parallel<sup>89</sup> and also in the combination *fa jin* 伐衿.<sup>90</sup> *Fa* involves drawing others' attention to some good qualities about oneself that is relatively visible, such as one's accomplishments (*gong* 功)<sup>91</sup>, the public benefits (*de* 德) they bring<sup>92</sup>, and the efforts involved (*lao* 勞).<sup>93</sup> In doing so, one tends to beautify them – *fa* over-extends one's actions in the way that flowery speech over-extends one's words.<sup>94</sup> The purpose is to acquire a

certain name and reputation – *fa* is associated with *ming* 名<sup>95</sup>, *yu* 譽<sup>96</sup>, and *ming yu* 名譽<sup>97</sup> – and such a concern is reflected in one’s own demeanor and appearance (*se* 色).<sup>98</sup>

*Jin* is also directed to acquiring a name and reputation (*ming yu* 名譽)<sup>99</sup> and affects one’s bearing (*rong* 容).<sup>100</sup> In fact, both *jin* and *fa* are used together to make the points that they stem from a concern to “buy” a reputation and establish a name for oneself<sup>101</sup> and are reflected in one’s demeanor and appearance.<sup>102</sup> The difference between the two is that *jin* concerns good qualities of oneself that are by comparison less visible. For example, *fa* concerns one’s accomplishments while *jin* concerns one’s abilities<sup>103</sup>, and *fa* concerns the benefits one brings while *jin* concerns one’s clear discernment regarding the merits of teachings.<sup>104</sup> *Jin* is also used in relation to one’s wisdom and abilities<sup>105</sup> as well as goodness in oneself<sup>106</sup>, which are all less easily visible than actual accomplishments and benefits. Since *jin* concerns qualities that are less visible, it carries a greater potential for false representation. It can involve one’s shifting between two opposing qualities, taking on the appearance of one when the other is not well-received<sup>107</sup>, and *jin* is at times associated with what is faked<sup>108</sup>, merging in its extreme form into the kind of blatant falsity that characterizes *kua*.

*Kua*, *fa* and *jin* all involve a concern with others’ favorable opinion of oneself. While *jiao* and *ao* involve a conception of oneself as being in a “high” position, these three terms involve a conception of oneself as being deserving of and “elevated” by the favorable opinion of others. These varieties of pride derive from a common human tendency to elevate oneself<sup>109</sup> and to raise oneself above others.<sup>110</sup> Such a tendency is manifested in many different ways, such as a desire to win over others<sup>111</sup>, to use devious arguments to suppress others<sup>112</sup>, or to always insist on one’s being right.<sup>113</sup> Early texts contain numerous other descriptions of problematic forms of pride, such as the presentation in the *Zhuangzi* 《莊子》 of the “four evils”: taking on huge

undertakings and changes in pursuit of accomplishments and reputation, encroaching on others' work to represent it as one's own, refusing to correct one's errors even when remonstrated with, and consistently endorsing those who agree with oneself but disapproving others who differ.<sup>114</sup> What is common to these varieties is an "inflated" self-conception of oneself, seeing oneself as in a "high" position and seeking to "elevate" oneself to reinforce such a self-conception.

### III. FIRST DIMENSION OF HUMILITY – DEFLATED SELF-CONCEPTION

There are two ways in which *man* 滿, *ying* 盈, and *yi* 溢 can be used to refer to problematic forms of pride. First, one may not have some desirable quality but makes a claim to having it, a point conveyed by *xu er wei ying* 虛而為盈<sup>115</sup> and *wei ying er yi* 未盈而溢.<sup>116</sup> Second, whether one has that quality or not, one may form a conscious self-conception of oneself being filled with it, a point put in terms of one's being full of oneself (*zi man* 自滿<sup>117</sup>, 自滿假<sup>118</sup>, and *jiao ying* 驕盈<sup>119</sup>) or overflowing (*jiao yi* 驕溢).<sup>120</sup>

In opposition to the second variant of pride, one should ideally not have such a conscious self-conception, a point conveyed in terms of "being full without overflowing" (*man er bu yi* 滿而不溢<sup>121</sup> and *ying er bu yi* 盈而不溢<sup>122</sup>); this is the way to "hold on to fullness" (*chi man* 持滿).<sup>123</sup> And the *Xunzi* 《荀子》 describes the way to "hold on to fullness" in terms of one's abiding by the apparent opposite of what one has – simplicity when sagely and wise, yielding (*rang* 讓) when accomplishments are tremendous, timidity when courageous, and *qian* 謙 when possessions are plenty.<sup>124</sup> Accordingly, the ideal person would have the substance but appear unfilled (*shi ru xu* 實如虛<sup>125</sup> or *shi ruo xu* 實若虛<sup>126</sup>). Thus, in opposition to the second variant



of pride, one should adopt a posture that is the opposite of the first variant of pride, namely, viewing oneself as being unfilled even if one is filled.

This “deflated” self-conception is conveyed by the term *qian*, which is idealized in the *Xunzi*<sup>127</sup> and *Liji* 《禮記》<sup>128</sup> and particularly so as one of the hexagrams in the *Yijing* 《易經》, the latter describing it as the handle of virtue (*de* 德) and regulator of the rites.<sup>129</sup> The *Shangshu* 《尚書》 opposes *qian* to *man*, a conscious self-conception of being filled, noting that the former leads to gain and the latter to loss.<sup>130</sup> The *Yijing* similarly opposes *qian* to *ying*<sup>131</sup> and idealizes the former, presenting the Way of Heaven as augmenting the former and diminishing the latter.<sup>132</sup> As the “deflated” self-conception that underlies traits opposed to pride, *qian* is often mentioned in connection with these traits, such as viewing oneself in a low position (*bei* 卑<sup>133</sup> or *qian xia* 謙下<sup>134</sup>). The superior person who devotes efforts (*lao* 勞) and is *qian* is someone who does not make a display of success (*bu fa* 不伐) nor claim credit (*bu de* 不德) but instead places himself below others (*xia ren* 下人).<sup>135</sup>

*Rang* 讓 and *bei* 卑 emphasize two aspects of this “deflated” self-conception that concern one’s relation to others – being yielding rather than competing, and lowering rather than elevating oneself. *Rang* is explicitly presented as a form of virtue<sup>136</sup> and even described as the chief of virtue<sup>137</sup> for which there is no comparison.<sup>138</sup> At the same time, *rang* is the most important aspect of the rites<sup>139</sup>, while *bei rang* is described as the basis of virtue<sup>140</sup> and the source of the rites.<sup>141</sup>

*Rang* involves yielding to others. In the political context, it can be a matter of yielding a position to those one regards as more worthy than oneself.<sup>142</sup> In relation to the rites in a drinking ceremony<sup>143</sup> or in the ancestral temple<sup>144</sup>, it involves exchanging bows and mutually yielding as

one proceeds. But the emphasis is not on the physical procedures<sup>145</sup> which is merely a matter of good form rather than the rites.<sup>146</sup> Instead, *rang* has to do with countering the human tendency at competitiveness (*zheng* 爭<sup>147</sup> or *zheng duo* 爭奪<sup>148</sup>). With *rang*, one yields upon seeing gains for oneself<sup>149</sup> instead of being subject to greed<sup>150</sup>, and will not act to suppress others.<sup>151</sup> In this way, *rang* serves as an antidote to the various forms of pride such as *fa*<sup>152</sup> and *jiao*.<sup>153</sup>

*Bei* is also explicitly opposed to *jiao*<sup>154</sup> and emphasizes viewing oneself as in a low position rather than elevating oneself. *Bei* and *rang* together highlight two related aspects of a more general phenomenon, with *bei* focused on restraining oneself and *rang* on yielding to others. That phenomenon is put in general terms as “lowering oneself and elevating others”<sup>155</sup>; it is the spirit of the rites and is contrasted with *jiao*.<sup>156</sup> It is also instantiated in a variety of ways, such as “exalting others and abasing oneself, putting others first and oneself last”<sup>157</sup>, “ascribing what is good to others and what is problematic to oneself”<sup>158</sup>, or “placing oneself beneath others”<sup>159</sup> instead of “elevating oneself at the expense of lowering others”.<sup>160</sup>

#### IV. SECOND DIMENSION OF HUMILITY – CAUTION AND FEARFULNESS

Pride leads to laxity as opposed to a posture of caution and fearfulness. The idea of fearfulness emphasizes one’s being on guard against problematic occurrences and is conveyed primarily by *ju* 懼 and *kong* 恐, and to some extent *jie* 戒. The idea of caution does not place special emphasis on problematic occurrences and is conveyed primarily by *jie* and *shen* 慎.

*Ju* can be used in relation to something that poses a threat to which one has a strong aversion, or to refer to an apprehensive attitude not tied to any specific threat. In the former case, *ju* can be triggered by some specific occurrence, such as a ruler learning about an alliance

between opponent states<sup>161</sup> or a wife's response to the prospect of being uncovered as the murderer of her husband.<sup>162</sup> When so triggered, *ju* is often accompanied by a sense of shock, as reflected in the combinations *jing ju* 驚懼<sup>163</sup> and *ti ju* 惕懼.<sup>164</sup> *Ju* can also be a response to ongoing circumstances rather than specific occurrences, such as potential conquest by a powerful neighboring state<sup>165</sup>, the advancing age of parents (and hence approach of death)<sup>166</sup>, the spread of corrupt teachings<sup>167</sup>, and inappropriate conduct by a lord.<sup>168</sup> *Ju* can also be directed to some potential threat not related to specific occurrences or circumstances but simply by virtue of its significance. Examples include the loss of virtue<sup>169</sup>, death<sup>170</sup>, criminal offence and punishment<sup>171</sup>, calamities<sup>172</sup>, and disgrace to oneself<sup>173</sup> or one's parents.<sup>174</sup> On this usage, *ju* is contrasted with joy (*xi* 喜)<sup>175</sup> and associated with anxiety (*you* 憂).<sup>176</sup>

*Ju* can also refer to a general apprehensive posture not tied to any specific threat, one presented in the *Shangshu* as appropriate to the ruler.<sup>177</sup> When so used, *ju* likely still emphasizes potential problems that one needs to pre-empt. For example, the worthy ruler is the more *ju* the more his territory expands, and he ponders on dangers when in safety, deprivation when plentiful, and loss when in attainment.<sup>178</sup> *Ju* in this usage is also associated with a dedicated and deliberative attitude. Someone who is *ju* would not dare to be lax<sup>179</sup>, is fond of planning to bring things to completion<sup>180</sup>, and would seek to find out what is incorrect when deliberating about what is correct.<sup>181</sup>

*Ju* is used in parallel to *kong*<sup>182</sup> and frequently in the combination *kong ju* 恐懼.<sup>183</sup> The use of *kong* is similar to *ju* in many respects. *Kong* is typically directed to something potentially problematic, such as a king's *kong* about being amiss in government<sup>184</sup>, a minister's *kong* about being replaced<sup>185</sup>, and a ruler's *kong* about loss of territory<sup>186</sup>, animosity of neighboring states<sup>187</sup>,

or rebellion of the people.<sup>188</sup> Even the objects of *kong* are similar to *ju*, such as criminal offence and punishment<sup>189</sup>, endangerment<sup>190</sup>, disgrace of ancestor<sup>191</sup>, and death<sup>192</sup> or being killed.<sup>193</sup> *Kong* is also contrasted with joy<sup>194</sup>, associated with anxiety<sup>195</sup>, and along with *ju* associated with a dedicated and deliberative attitude.<sup>196</sup> *Kong* is explicitly contrasted with various forms of pride such as *jiao ao* 驕傲.<sup>197</sup>

Despite their similarities, *kong* differs from *ju* in that it is typically used in relation to the possibility of problematic occurrences rather than their imminence or likelihood. In the political context, *kong* might concern the possibility that one's virtue be not comparable to one's predecessors<sup>198</sup>, that a certain state attacking another might have one's own state as its real target<sup>199</sup>, that one's military might not be up to the task<sup>200</sup>, or that one cannot hold on to the territories one has acquired.<sup>201</sup> Other examples include *kong* regarding the possibility that certain semblances of virtue be mistaken for genuine virtue<sup>202</sup>, that one might lose one's wealth<sup>203</sup> or what one has learnt<sup>204</sup>, or that the proper relation between men and women be overlooked.<sup>205</sup> *Kong* might even be directed toward some possible problem whose nature one is not sure about, such as some ominous event<sup>206</sup> or potentially bad outcomes of divination.<sup>207</sup> Thus, *kong* is more like being concerned, worried, or afraid that something bad might happen, unlike *ju* which is more like fear, or fearing that something bad might happen along with some noticeable emotional response.

Turning to *jie* 戒, it concerns one's acute awareness of the importance of certain areas of life and vigilance about what needs to be done or avoided. For example, the *Shangshu* speaks of *jie* in relation to virtue<sup>208</sup>, the *Lunyu* 《論語》 refers to the three *jie* at three different stages of life<sup>209</sup>, and the *Zhuangzi* refers to decree (*ming* 命) and righteousness (*yi* 義) as the two great *jie*.<sup>210</sup> *Jie* can also refer to such a posture without specifying any area of life<sup>211</sup>, and is used

verbally to urge someone to adopt such a posture.<sup>212</sup> Being *jie*, one will not be lax<sup>213</sup> or forgetful<sup>214</sup>, and so *jie* is opposed to *jiao*.<sup>215</sup> In government, for example, one would learn from history about the source of order and disorder so as to *jie* oneself.<sup>216</sup>

At times, *jie* is used in relation to specific problems that one needs to be on guard against, such as strong military opponents<sup>217</sup> or various forms of pride.<sup>218</sup> Relatedly, it can refer to one's warning someone against such potential problems.<sup>219</sup> Being on guard, one will carefully plan and deliberate, and will be well-prepared (*bei* 備) for whatever dangers might come<sup>220</sup>, especially in a military context.<sup>221</sup> This use of *jie* accounts for its association with *ju* in the sense of an apprehensive attitude, as reflected in the combination *jie ju* 戒懼.<sup>222</sup>

Finally, *shen* 慎 is like *jie* and unlike *kong* and *ju* in that it concerns a posture of caution not specifically linked to problematic occurrences, accounting for its more frequent association with *jie*<sup>223</sup> including in the combination *jie shen* 戒慎.<sup>224</sup> In the governmental context, one can be *shen* in relation to the throne that one occupies<sup>225</sup>, official responsibilities<sup>226</sup>, governmental affairs<sup>227</sup>, the issue of orders<sup>228</sup>, the recommendation of officials<sup>229</sup>, the education of a prince<sup>230</sup> and selection of his teacher<sup>231</sup>, punishment<sup>232</sup>, as well as the institution of rites and music.<sup>233</sup> Other examples include *shen* in listening<sup>234</sup>, the choice of profession<sup>235</sup>, one's comportment<sup>236</sup>, the influences one is exposed to<sup>237</sup>, the way one conducts oneself<sup>238</sup>, one's words<sup>239</sup> and actions<sup>240</sup>, the conclusion of an affair or a life<sup>241</sup>, as well as *du* 獨, which likely refers to the subtle incipient movements of the heart/mind.<sup>242</sup>

At times, *shen* is directed to something positively valued such as virtue<sup>243</sup> or making luminous one's virtue.<sup>244</sup> At times, it is directed to something negatively valued such as crime and wickedness<sup>245</sup>, exposure to problematic words and action<sup>246</sup>, and problematic behavior.<sup>247</sup> In all these instances, the emphasis is on exercising caution to ensure that one proceeds properly.

For this purpose, one needs to ponder on (*si* 思)<sup>248</sup> and deliberate about (*lu* 慮)<sup>249</sup> what is proper or improper, and *shen* also occurs in the combinations *shen si* 慎思<sup>250</sup> and *shen lu* 慎慮<sup>251</sup> to emphasize caution in these two processes themselves. This emphasis on careful pondering and deliberation distinguishes *shen* from *jie*, the latter emphasizing primarily the importance one attaches to a certain area of life.

Another distinguishing characteristic of *shen* is its emphasis on minute details of the way one proceeds. It involves careful discriminatory judgement about different courses of action and their consequences, such as the way one will be judged by one's words<sup>252</sup>, the nature of different professions that one takes up<sup>253</sup>, or what the different qualities of a person might give rise to.<sup>254</sup> In a comment on the ideal operation of the heart/mind, one is urged to be *jie* in relation to potential errors and *shen* in relation to what is minute (*jie guo shen wei* 戒過慎微).<sup>255</sup> Its use in relation to *du* 獨 and *wei* 微, both referring to the minute movements of the heart/mind that can easily go astray, confirms this point.

## V. THIRD DIMENSION OF HUMILITY – SERIOUSNESS AND AWE

We saw earlier that *gong* 恭 is opposed to *jiao*, *ao* and *fa* and related to *qian* and *rang*. Two points are worthy noting regarding *gong*. First, as it is often used in connection with personal interactions, it may appear to concern primarily such interactions. For example, it characterizes the way a ruler receives ministers<sup>256</sup> or approaches the common people<sup>257</sup>, the way one presents offerings to a king<sup>258</sup> or listens to an elder<sup>259</sup>, and the interaction between host and guest.<sup>260</sup> But *gong* is also used in contexts not primarily about personal interactions, such as in relation to the spirits<sup>261</sup>, official responsibilities<sup>262</sup>, the way the king executes the punishment

ordained by Heaven<sup>263</sup>, the way one silently reflects on the Way<sup>264</sup>, and the way one conducts oneself in general<sup>265</sup> including in one's own home.<sup>266</sup>

Second, it may appear that *gong* primarily concerns one's outward appearance and conduct. For example, it characterizes one's appearance<sup>267</sup>, body<sup>268</sup>, hand (movements)<sup>269</sup>, as well as Shun's posture while sitting facing south.<sup>270</sup> In conduct, it is often related to the rites<sup>271</sup> and contrasted with insult.<sup>272</sup> But *gong* is not just a matter of outward appearance and conduct. For example, the *Mengzi* 《孟子》 speaks of the heart/mind of *gong* when interacting with others<sup>273</sup> and distinguishes it from a pleasant outer appearance.<sup>274</sup> It also refers to the heart/mind of *gong jing*<sup>275</sup>, which should be present before the presentation of a gift, implying that it is a posture of the heart/mind.<sup>276</sup>

A hint regarding the nature of this posture is found in *gong*'s relation to *jian* 儉, being appropriately conservative in expenditure. The combination *gong jian* 恭儉 occurs frequently<sup>277</sup>, and the two terms are often used in parallel<sup>278</sup> such as in the comment that one does not aim at *jiao* with respect to official position nor at extravagance with respect to emolument.<sup>279</sup> This shows that, just as *jian* involves being appropriately conservative in expenditure as opposed to extravagance, *gong* has to do with a serious posture as opposed to *jiao*, which involves taking things lightly. It involves one's viewing what is at issue as demanding one's serious attention, whether the persons with whom one interacts, the spirits, one's official responsibilities, Heaven's punishment that one executes, or the Way that one reflects on. One gives serious attention to the way one proceeds outwardly, including one's demeanor and appearance when interacting with others as well as the way one proceeds and carries oneself in general. That *gong* has to do with such a posture of seriousness is reflected in its association with two terms with similar connotations, *su* 肅<sup>280</sup> and *yan* 嚴.<sup>281</sup>

The term *zhuang* 莊 takes this seriousness further. Like *gong*, it is often used in association with *jing* and in the combination *zhuang jing*<sup>282</sup>, which sometimes occurs alongside *gong*.<sup>283</sup> The use of *zhuang* exhibits several similarities to *gong*. For example, it characterizes one's demeanor and appearance (*se* 色<sup>284</sup>, *rong mao* 容貌<sup>285</sup>, or *wai mao* 外貌<sup>286</sup>) as well as one's movements and conduct<sup>287</sup>, including in one's own home.<sup>288</sup> Like *gong*, *zhuang* is a matter not just of outward appearance but of the heart/mind<sup>289</sup>; one should have such a heart/mind as one prepares for sacrifices.<sup>290</sup> It is also associated with *su*; the *Xunzi* comments on how music characterized by *su zhuang* 肅莊 can contribute to orderliness<sup>291</sup> and how proper music can bring about a heart/mind characterized by *zhuang*.<sup>292</sup>

There are two differences between *zhuang* and *gong*. First, by contrast to *gong*, *zhuang* is more frequently associated with *yan*, as seen from the combination *yan zhuang* 嚴莊<sup>293</sup> and the association of *zhuang jing* 莊敬 with *yan wei* 嚴威<sup>294</sup>. *Yan* connotes a deep sense of seriousness explained in terms of “solidifying what is within and making upright what is without” (*jian zhong zheng wai* 堅中正外).<sup>295</sup> One's concern is with ensuring not just that everything is outwardly proper, but also that the proper posture is inwardly and fully present. That is, one not only takes other individuals and one's responsibilities seriously, but also takes seriously one's having such a serious posture. This adds to the sense of “heaviness” that accompanies such seriousness, warranting the description in terms of a sense of gravity.

Second, *zhuang* in addition emphasizes the awe-inspiring effect of this sense of gravity, as seen from the combination *wei zhuang* 威莊.<sup>296</sup> The posture *yan zhuang* 嚴莊 leads to *wei* 威<sup>297</sup>, and *zhuang jing* 莊敬, which is contrasted with a heart/mind lacking in seriousness (*yi man zhi xin* 易慢之心), leads to *yan wei* 嚴威.<sup>298</sup> The point can be seen in other contexts. For



example, approaching the people with *zhuang* results in *jing* from the people<sup>299</sup> while doing so without *zhuang* results in the opposite.<sup>300</sup> *Yan zhuang* leads the people to view one with awe (*wei* 畏)<sup>301</sup> while the absence of *zhuang* results in one's subordinates taking one lightly.<sup>302</sup> Thus, *zhuang* is like *gong* in having to do with a posture of seriousness, but to an extent that carries a sense of gravity with an accompanying awe-inspiring effect.

Turning to *wei* 畏, while it is a response to *yan zhuang* as well as to *yan*<sup>303</sup> and often to *wei* 威<sup>304</sup>, it is also a posture that accompanies (rather than as a response to) *yan gong*<sup>305</sup>, *gong jing*<sup>306</sup>, and *jing*.<sup>307</sup> As such, it also takes the posture of seriousness involved in *gong* further. *Wei* 畏 is often directed to something positively valued, such as righteousness<sup>308</sup>, models and guidelines<sup>309</sup>, the good ruler<sup>310</sup>, Heaven<sup>311</sup>, and the Mandate of Heaven along with the great person and words of the sages.<sup>312</sup> When directed to Heaven or a human person, it is described as a response to the awe-inspiring quality (*wei* 威) of its object, such as Heaven<sup>313</sup>, the ruler<sup>314</sup> and the superior person.<sup>315</sup> Even when directed to other objects such as righteousness, it involves one's being positively impressed by and looking up to that object, with a sense of submission to it. This usage of *wei* can be combined with other favorable orientations toward its object. For example, the successful ruler is such that his officials<sup>316</sup> as well as the people<sup>317</sup> will both *wei* and love him, while other states will cherish his beneficence and *wei* his prestige.<sup>318</sup>

But, like the English word "awe", *wei* can also be associated with a negative view of its object that is akin to fear. The co-presence of both positive and negative aspects can be explained by the fact that one can respond to something of towering impressiveness differently depending on perspective. When confronting thunder and lightning, one might be positively impressed and struck with a sense of wonder as a mere spectator, but will feel fear if one sees oneself as potentially endangered. *Wei* in its negative aspect can be directed to a variety of objects, such as

people's gossip about oneself<sup>319</sup>, death<sup>320</sup>, criminal verdict<sup>321</sup>, punishment<sup>322</sup>, a powerful official<sup>323</sup>, or a strong opposing army.<sup>324</sup> In this usage, *wei* is closely associated with *ju*<sup>325</sup> and *kong*.<sup>326</sup>

It is in its first usage that *wei* describes a posture that accompanies *gong* and *jing*, involving one's being favorably impressed by and looking up to some object. Such a posture differs from the first dimension of humility, which involves a deflated self-conception that is directed against the human tendency to elevate oneself over others and at competitiveness, one that emphasizes awareness of one's own limitations and a view of oneself as lower. By contrast, *wei* emphasizes the impressiveness of its object and a sense of submission to it. The comparison involved is not of the same level – one sees the object of *wei* as belonging to a different order to which one feels a sense of submission.

## VI. JING AND HUMILITY

In sections 3 to 5, we discussed three dimensions of humility comprising traits opposed to the varieties of pride discussed in section 2. In this final section, we consider the term *jing* 敬, which encompasses all three dimensions.

*Jing* can be directed to some superhuman or human object, and qualifies the way one interacts with it. It can be directed to Heaven<sup>327</sup> or the spirits<sup>328</sup>, and qualifies the way one serves the lord-on-high and the spirits<sup>329</sup> or engages in sacrifices.<sup>330</sup> It can be directed to the ruler<sup>331</sup> or parents<sup>332</sup>, and qualifies the way one serves the ruler<sup>333</sup> or parents.<sup>334</sup> It can be directed to elders or others standing in special social relations to oneself<sup>335</sup> as well as to human beings in general.<sup>336</sup> In this connection, *jing* is still closely related to one's activities. A ruler's *jing* in

relation to people (of the upper class) is primarily a matter of his policies<sup>337</sup> and dedication to governmental affairs<sup>338</sup>, and *jing* in relation to the common people concerns deploying their labor<sup>339</sup> in a way like conducting an important sacrifice.<sup>340</sup>

*Jing* can also be directed to an object that is neither superhuman nor human and that is positively viewed or carries significance in itself, and qualifies what one does in relation to that object. For example, it can be directed to virtue<sup>341</sup> and qualifies the way one makes luminous one's virtue.<sup>342</sup> It can be directed to one's own person (*shen* 身) and qualifies the way one conducts one's own person<sup>343</sup>, which reflects on oneself and one's parents.<sup>344</sup> It can be directed to righteousness<sup>345</sup> and qualifies the way one abides by it<sup>346</sup>, to a ruler's decrees<sup>347</sup> or one's responsibilities<sup>348</sup> and qualifies the way one implements the decrees<sup>349</sup> or responsibilities.<sup>350</sup> Other examples include *jing* directed to one's comportment<sup>351</sup>, models and guidelines<sup>352</sup>, social divisions<sup>353</sup>, and one's work.<sup>354</sup> *Jing* can also be directed to some activity of significance in itself, such as learning<sup>355</sup> and teaching<sup>356</sup>, and can qualify activities of various kinds, such as the way one conducts oneself<sup>357</sup>, listens to an ode<sup>358</sup>, continues the way of Yao<sup>359</sup>, carries out instructions<sup>360</sup>, and imposes punishment.<sup>361</sup>

Finally, *jing* can refer to an overall posture of a person as such, without being directed to any specific object or activity. For example, one might be urged to be *jing* or to practice *jing*<sup>362</sup>, to make *jing* one's resting place<sup>363</sup>, to dwell in *jing*<sup>364</sup>, and to practice *jing* day and night.<sup>365</sup> The *Lunyu* describes the superior person as *jing* without being amiss in anything<sup>366</sup> and as someone who cultivates himself to achieve *jing*<sup>367</sup>, while the *Yijing* presents *jing* as something that one practices so as to straighten oneself on the inside.<sup>368</sup> As an overall posture of a person, *jing* approximates humility in the broad sense, encompassing all its three dimensions.

In regard to the first dimension, *jing*<sup>369</sup> and *gong jing*<sup>370</sup> are related to *rang*, often occurring in the combination *jing rang*.<sup>371</sup> *Jing* is the spirit behind the rites<sup>372</sup>, which as we saw involves lowering oneself and elevating others, and *jing* itself is directly related to viewing others as “higher” (*zun* 尊)<sup>373</sup> and oneself as “lower” (*bei* 卑).<sup>374</sup> In addition, the rites are also related to *qian*<sup>375</sup>, *rang*<sup>376</sup>, *bei*<sup>377</sup>, and *bei rang*.<sup>378</sup>

In regard to the second dimension, *jing* occurs in the combinations *jing ju*<sup>379</sup>, *jing jie*<sup>380</sup>, and *jing shen*.<sup>381</sup> It is contrasted with a causal<sup>382</sup>, lax<sup>383</sup>, and playful or idle<sup>384</sup> attitude, and is separately related to *jie*<sup>385</sup> and especially *shen*.<sup>386</sup>

In regard to the third dimension, *jing* is frequently associated with *gong*<sup>387</sup> and used in the combination *gong jing*.<sup>388</sup> It is also associated with *wei* 畏<sup>389</sup> and with *zhuang* in the combination *zhuang jing*.<sup>390</sup> Both *wei* and *jing* can be directed to the same objects, such as the worthy person<sup>391</sup> or decrees and guidelines<sup>392</sup>, and the two terms occur in the combination *wei jing* 畏敬.<sup>393</sup>

We saw earlier that *jing* is closely related to one’s activities. Even when directed to some superhuman, human, or non-human object, *jing* is not just a matter of the way one views the object, but concerns how one proceeds in activities related to that object. To better understand how the three dimensions of humility come together in *jing*, let us therefore consider *jing* in the context of one’s activities in an area of life of significance. To give concrete substance to the discussion, let us consider as example the study of classical texts, which Confucian thinkers believe should be approached with *jing*. The discussion of this example is intended to apply not just to the Confucians’ study of the canonical texts, but also our own contemporary study of the Chinese classics.

In regard to the first dimension, one's primary concern is with the study as such, not with the favorable opinion of others. One does not deliberately draw attention to one's abilities and accomplishments nor put on an exaggerated or false display of such. One does not exhibit a pattern of thinking of oneself as being above others, whether consciously comparative or otherwise, and is non-competitive. Instead, one works with an acute awareness of one's own limitations and is ready to acknowledge one's errors, others' accomplishments, as well as one's debt to others' past work. It is not problematic to have awareness of one's own merits, but one does not form an "inflated" self-conception that involves a pattern of consciously thinking to such merits. Instead, one works with a "deflated" self-conception that involves seeing oneself as part of a larger community of inquiry, focusing on one's contribution to advancing the inquiry with minimal concern for gains for oneself.

In regard to the second dimension, because one's concern is with advancing the inquiry as such, not with quick results for personal gains, one would approach the inquiry with caution and fearfulness. On the one hand, one aims at conclusions that are well-grounded, paying careful attention to the textual evidence and their fine details. On the other hand, one is constantly on guard against errors, not just in one's conclusions but in relation to subtle psychological dynamics that might skew one's conclusions, such as the tendency to force the evidence to fit in with one's preconceptions.

In regard to the third dimension, one gives serious attention to details in the inquiry to ensure that one's conclusions are fully substantiated by the evidence. At the same time, one also takes seriously the overall approach to the inquiry as such – in our contemporary terms, the methodological approach – to ensure that it is appropriate to the goals of the inquiry. In addition, one conducts the inquiry with the sense that one is responding to something "larger" that draws

one and demands one's attention. Part of this is the sense of overall progress, the sense that one is not just coming up with new or different conclusions, but making genuine advances in understanding and approximating some ideal limit that draws one. Another part is the sense of the boundlessness of the inquiry – there is no limit to the advances one can make in a specific area nor limit to the scope of inquiry with the multiplicities of ideas and connections between ideas awaiting exploration. This is not a source of stress since what occupies one's attention is not the demands on one's time, effort and labor, but a source of joy since what captures one's attention is the boundlessness of the world of learning that is open to one's endless exploration for a lifetime. In the case of the Confucians' study of the canonical texts, the sentiment also involves their sense that they are listening to the voices of the past sages via these texts.

A similar account can be provided for other Confucian examples, such as the posture of an official toward his governmental responsibilities. Ultimately, for the Confucians, *jing* is a posture toward one's life as such, a posture that involves one's seeing one's life as part of a larger ethical whole – one works with a deflated self-conception in all areas of life, exercises ethical caution and fearfulness in the way one conducts oneself, taking seriously this approach to life and at the same time being uplifted by the sense of participation in the Way. This posture of humility, encompassing all its three dimensions and not tied to any specific activity or area of life, is the overall posture that constitutes *jing* as a quality of the superior person.<sup>394</sup>

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, BERKELEY

## REFERENCES

**(1) Sinological Series**

SBBY *Sibubeiyao* 四部備要 (Taipei: Taiwan Zhonghua Shuju 臺灣中華書局).

SKQS *Wenyuange Sikuquanshu* (Intranet ver.) 文淵閣四庫全書內聯網版 (Hong Kong: Digital Heritage Publishing 迪志文化出版).

**(2) Texts**

*Guanzi* 管子 (SBBY edition).

*Guoyu* 國語 (SBBY edition).

*Hanfeizi* 韓非子 (SBBY edition).

*Huainanzi* 淮南子 (SBBY edition).

*Laozi* 老子 (SBBY edition). References include page and passage numbers.

*Liezi* 列子 (SBBY edition).

*Liji* 禮記 (SBBY edition).

*Lunyu* 論語. References follow the numbering of passages in Yang Bojun 楊伯峻, *Lunyu Yizhu* 論語譯注 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju 中華書局, 1980).

*Lushichunqiu* 呂氏春秋 (SKQS edition).

*Mengzi* 孟子. References follow the numbering of passages, with book numbers 1A-7B substituted for 1-14, in Yang Bojun 楊伯峻, *Mengzi Yizhu* 孟子譯注 2<sup>nd</sup> edition (Beijing: Zhunghua Shuju 中華書局, 1984).

*Mozi* 墨子 (SKQS edition).

*Shangshu* 尚書. References are by page numbers to James Legge, trans., *The Chinese Classics*,

*Volume III: The Shoo King*. Reprint. (Taipei 臺北: Southern Materials Center, Inc. 南天書局有限公司, 1985).

*Shenzi* 慎子 (SBBY edition).

*Shijing* 詩經. References follow the ode and section numbers in Yang Renzhi 楊任之, *Shijing*

*Jinyi Jinzhu* 詩經今譯今注 (Tianjin: Tianjin Guji Chubanshe 天津古籍出版社, 1986).

Wang Yangming 王陽明 *Chuanxilu* 傳習錄. References follow the numbering of passages in

Chan Wing-tsit 陳榮捷, *Wang Yangming Chuanxilu Xiangzhu Jiping* 王陽明傳習錄詳註集評 (Taipei: Xuesheng Shuju 學生書局, 1983).

*Xiaojing* 孝經 in *Xiaojing Zhushu* 孝經注疏 (SBBY edition).

*Xunzi* 荀子 (SBBY edition).

*Yijing* 易經 in *Zhouyi Wang-Han Zhu* 周易王韓注 (SBBY edition).

*Zhuangzi* 莊子 (SBBY edition).

*Zuozhuan* 左傳 in *Chunqiu Zuoshizhuan Dushijijie* 春秋左氏傳杜氏集解 (SBBY edition)

## ENDNOTES

---

<sup>1</sup> *Chuanxilu* 《傳習錄》 no. 339.

<sup>2</sup> *Xunzi* 《荀子》 2.2b; *Lushichunqiu* 《呂氏春秋》 15.9a.

<sup>3</sup> *Shenzi* 《慎子》 7b; *Hanfeizi* 《韓非子》 15.6b.

<sup>4</sup> *Laozi* 《老子》 1.17b, no. 30.

<sup>5</sup> *Zhuangzi* 《莊子》 8.17a.

<sup>6</sup> *Shangshu* 《尚書》 575.

<sup>7</sup> *Guoyu* 《國語》 12.5b, 14.12a; *Liji* 《禮記》 19.15a.

<sup>8</sup> *Guanzi* 《管子》 5.13b, 17.8b.

<sup>9</sup> *Guanzi* 20.11b; *Xiaojing* 《孝經》 2.1a.

<sup>10</sup> *Guanzi* 4.6b.

<sup>11</sup> *Shangshu* 60.

<sup>12</sup> *Guoyu* 21.1a.



- 
- <sup>13</sup> *Lunyu* 《論語》 7. 26.  
<sup>14</sup> *Xunzi* 2.2a.  
<sup>15</sup> *Xunzi* 3.11a.  
<sup>16</sup> *Zuozhuan* 《左傳》 15.14a-14b.  
<sup>17</sup> *Guanzi* 13.9b; *Liji* 1.3a.  
<sup>18</sup> *Yijing* 《易經》 2.6a.  
<sup>19</sup> *Yijing* 9.5a.  
<sup>20</sup> *Yijing* 2.5b.  
<sup>21</sup> *Shangshu* 65.  
<sup>22</sup> *Xunzi* 3.16a-16b, 20.1a-1b.  
<sup>23</sup> *Xunzi* 3.16a-16b.  
<sup>24</sup> *Guanzi* 11.10a.  
<sup>25</sup> *Guanzi* 17.8b.  
<sup>26</sup> *Guoyu* 12.1a-1b.  
<sup>27</sup> *Liji* 16.1a.  
<sup>28</sup> *Shangshu* 532-533; *Huainanzi* 《淮南子》 9.15b.  
<sup>29</sup> *Guanzi* 11.15a.  
<sup>30</sup> *Liji* 14.26a, *Yijing* 7.6a.  
<sup>31</sup> *Yijing* 7.6a.  
<sup>32</sup> *Shangshu* 15.  
<sup>33</sup> *Xunzi* 2.2a.  
<sup>34</sup> *Xunzi* 8.2b.  
<sup>35</sup> *Liji* 17.1a.  
<sup>36</sup> *Xunzi* 2.2a.  
<sup>37</sup> *Xunzi* 4.10b.  
<sup>38</sup> *Shangshu* 466.  
<sup>39</sup> *Guanzi* 20.10b.  
<sup>40</sup> *Lunyu* 13: 26, cf. 20: 2.  
<sup>41</sup> *Mengzi* 《孟子》 3B:4.  
<sup>42</sup> *Hanfeizi* 2.8b, 12.6a.  
<sup>43</sup> *Xunzi* 7.11b, *Laozi* 1.17a, no. 29.  
<sup>44</sup> *Zuozhuan* 19.16a; *Guoyu* 2.12a; *Hanfeizi* 12.9a, 18.4a-4b; *Guanzi* 5.3a, 5.13b.  
<sup>45</sup> *Xunzi* 6.4a.  
<sup>46</sup> *Lunyu* 7: 26.  
<sup>47</sup> *Guoyu* 12.5b, 14.12a; *Liji* 19.15a.  
<sup>48</sup> *Lunyu* 20: 2.  
<sup>49</sup> *Lunyu* 1: 15, 14: 10.  
<sup>50</sup> *Laozi* 1.5a, no. 9; *Hanfeizi* 6.3a-3b.  
<sup>51</sup> *Shangshu* 532-533; *Guoyu* 18.10a; *Xunzi* 3.11a; *Liji* 16.12b; *Yijing* 1.3a; *Xiaojing* 2.1a, 6.1b.  
<sup>52</sup> *Zuozhuan* 11.5b, 28.8a.  
<sup>53</sup> *Zuozhuan* 1.10b.  
<sup>54</sup> *Zuozhuan* 13.25a; *Guoyu* 16.3b.  
<sup>55</sup> *Shangshu* 575; *Zuozhuan* 1.10b.  
<sup>56</sup> *Zuozhuan* 12.20b.  
<sup>57</sup> *Guoyu* 16.1b.  
<sup>58</sup> *Guanzi* 5.13b.  
<sup>59</sup> *Guoyu* 2.6b.  
<sup>60</sup> *Guoyu* 16.1b; *Xunzi* 12.12b.  
<sup>61</sup> *Xunzi* 3.11a.  
<sup>62</sup> *Hanfeizi* 15.3a.  
<sup>63</sup> *Hanfeizi* 18.9a.  
<sup>64</sup> *Hanfeizi* 15.4b, 15.5a.

- 
- <sup>65</sup> *Guanzi* 5.13b.  
<sup>66</sup> *Zhuangzi* 8.17a.  
<sup>67</sup> *Guoyu* 2.6b.  
<sup>68</sup> *Hanfeizi* 5.4b.  
<sup>69</sup> *Guanzi* 5.13b.  
<sup>70</sup> *Zuozhuan* 23.23a.  
<sup>71</sup> *Xunzi* 2.9b, 4.10b; *Hanfeizi* 5.4b; *Guanzi* 10.12a.  
<sup>72</sup> *Mengzi* 2A:4.  
<sup>73</sup> *Liji* 15.4a.  
<sup>74</sup> *Xunzi* 11.7b.  
<sup>75</sup> *Zuozhuan* 18.22a-22b.  
<sup>76</sup> *Liji* 19.11b.  
<sup>77</sup> *Zhuangzi* 10.6b.  
<sup>78</sup> *Hanfeizi* 18.5b.  
<sup>79</sup> *Huainanzi* 11.13a.  
<sup>80</sup> *Xunzi* 1.5a.  
<sup>81</sup> *Xunzi* 1.6a.  
<sup>82</sup> *Hanfeizi* 10.6a.  
<sup>83</sup> *Hanfeizi* 7.7a.  
<sup>84</sup> *Xunzi* 2.2a.  
<sup>85</sup> *Zhuangzi* 8.17a.  
<sup>86</sup> *Xunzi* 2.6a.  
<sup>87</sup> *Liezi* 《列子》 7.6a.  
<sup>88</sup> *Lushichunqiu* 1.7b.  
<sup>89</sup> *Shangshu* 60; *Xunzi* 16.7a; *Hanfeizi* 17.8b; *Guanzi* 4.4a; *Laozi* 1.12b, no. 22; 1.13b, no. 24, 1.17b, no. 30.  
<sup>90</sup> *Guanzi* 5.11a; *Huainanzi* 13.4a.  
<sup>91</sup> *Shangshu* 60; *Mozi* 1.4a, 5.5a; *Guanzi* 4.4a, 20.9b; *Lao* 1.12b, no. 22; 1.13b, no. 24; *Zhuangzi* 7.11b.  
<sup>92</sup> *Xunzi* 3.17a, 16.7a.  
<sup>93</sup> *Hanfeizi* 17.8b.  
<sup>94</sup> *Xunzi* 20.7b.  
<sup>95</sup> *Guanzi* 21.13b; *Zhuangzi* 7.11b.  
<sup>96</sup> *Mozi* 《墨子》 5.5a.  
<sup>97</sup> *Mozi* 1.4a.  
<sup>98</sup> *Xunzi* 3.17a, 16.6b-7a, 20.11b.  
<sup>99</sup> *Liezi* 1.12b.  
<sup>100</sup> *Xunzi* 16.7a.  
<sup>101</sup> *Guanzi* 5.11a.  
<sup>102</sup> *Huainanzi* 13.4a.  
<sup>103</sup> *Shangshu* 60, cf. 257.  
<sup>104</sup> *Xunzi* 16.7a.  
<sup>105</sup> *Hanfeizi* 15.6b.  
<sup>106</sup> *Hanfeizi* 17.8b.  
<sup>107</sup> *Huainanzi* 13.7a.  
<sup>108</sup> *Hanfeizi* 15.3b, 15.6b; *Huainanzi* 11.2b, 11.15b.  
<sup>109</sup> *Guoyu* 2.14b.  
<sup>110</sup> *Zuozhuan* 20.14a; *Guoyu* 3.2a, 15.7a.  
<sup>111</sup> *Guoyu* 19.2b; *Hanfeizi* 5.1b.  
<sup>112</sup> *Guoyu* 18.9b.  
<sup>113</sup> *Laozi* 1.12b, no. 22; 1.13b, no. 24.  
<sup>114</sup> *Zhuangzi* 10.5a.  
<sup>115</sup> *Lunyu* 7: 26.  
<sup>116</sup> *Guoyu* 21.1a.

- 
- 117 *Shangshu* 182.  
118 *Shangshu* 60.  
119 *Xunzi* 3.16a-16b.  
120 *Xunzi* 2.2a; *Huainanzi* 10.13a, 15.16b.  
121 *Guanzi* 20.11b; *Huainanzi* 13.20a; *Xiaoqing* 2.1a.  
122 *Guoyu* 21.1a.  
123 *Guanzi* 20.11b.  
124 *Xunzi* 20.1a-1b.  
125 *Huainanzi* 10.2a.  
126 *Lunyu* 8: 5.  
127 *Xunzi* 3.16b.  
128 *Liji* 11.25b.  
129 *Yijing* 8.6b-7a.  
130 *Shangzhu* 65.  
131 *Yijing* 9.5a.  
132 *Yijing* 2.5b.  
133 *Yijing* 2.5b, 2.6a.  
134 *Zhuangzi* 10.18b.  
135 *Yijing* 7.6a.  
136 *Shangshu* 87; *Guoyu* 10.17b-18a.  
137 *Zuozhuan* 22.9a.  
138 *Guoyu* 3.9b-10b.  
139 *Zuozhuan* 15.14a-14b.  
140 *Zuozhuan* 8.3b.  
141 *Zuozhuan* 20.18b-19a.  
142 *Shangshu* 533; *Guoyu* 10.17b-18a, 15.5b.  
143 *Liji* 20.5a.  
144 *Liji* 20.14b.  
145 *Xunzi* 14.3b.  
146 *Zuozhuan* 25.10a.  
147 *Zuozhuan* 22.9a; *Xunzi* 2.8a.  
148 *Liji* 7.7b.  
149 *Liji* 11.26a.  
150 *Guoyu* 2.7a.  
151 *Guoyu* 2.14b.  
152 *Zuozhuan* 15.14a-14b.  
153 *Xunzi* 3.11a.  
154 *Guanzi* 13.9b; *Liji* 1.3a.  
155 *Liji* 1.3a, 17.5a.  
156 *Liji* 1.3a.  
157 *Liji* 15.15b.  
158 *Liji* 15.16b.  
159 *Zuozhuan* 11.2a; *Lunyu* 12: 20.  
160 *Zhuangzi* 9.16b.  
161 *Hanfeizi* 3.9a.  
162 *Hanfeizi* 16.4b-5a.  
163 *Lushichunqiu* 11.4b.  
164 *Lushichunqiu* 15.2a.  
165 *Guoyu* 3.1b, 5.2b.  
166 *Lunyu* 4: 21.  
167 *Mengzi* 3B:9.  
168 *Guoyu* 14.9a, 15.7b, 17.10b.  
169 *Zuozhuan* 2.3a-3b.

- 
- 170 *Guanzi* 9.1b.  
171 *Guanzi* 16.9a-9b.  
172 *Guoyu* 15.4b; *Hanfeizi* 2.16a-16b.  
173 *Xunzi* 1.12b.  
174 *Liji* 1.5a.  
175 *Guoyu* 15.4b; *Lunyu* 4: 21; *Mozi* 2.11a.  
176 *Lunshichunqiu* 15.2a.  
177 *Shangshu* 184, 287, 466, 588.  
178 *Lushichunqiu* 15.1a-1b.  
179 *Shangshu* 466.  
180 *Lunyu* 7: 11.  
181 *Xunzi* 15.10a.  
182 *Shijing* 《詩經》 201/1, 201/2; *Lushichunqiu* 3.10a, 15.1a-1b.  
183 *Zuozhuan* 13.6b; *Guoyu* 19.3a; *Xunzi* 1.10b, 3.15a-15b, 7.5a, 8.2a; *Lushichunqiu* 18.4b; *Hanfeizi* 2.16b; *Liji* 16.1a, 19.11a.  
184 *Guoyu* 1.14a.  
185 *Zhuangzi* 6.15a.  
186 *Guoyu* 7.10a.  
187 *Guoyu* 9.5a.  
188 *Guoyu* 19.5b-6a.  
189 *Guanzi* 1.17a, 5.10b, cf. 1.2a-2b.  
190 *Huainanzi* 2.4b; *Xunzi* 16.10b.  
191 *Xiaojing* 8.1b.  
192 *Zuozhuan* 13.26b.  
193 *Hanfeizi* 7.9a.  
194 *Guanzi* 5.10b.  
195 *Xunzi* 16.10b, 20.8b.  
196 *Lushichunqiu* 15.1a-1b.  
197 *Guanzi* 17.8b.  
198 *Shangshu* 250.  
199 *Hanfeizi* 7.7a.  
200 *Guanzi* 24.18a.  
201 *Huainanzi* 12.17a.  
202 *Mengzi* 7B:37.  
203 *Zuozhuan* 18.27b.  
204 *Lunyu* 8: 17.  
205 *Liji* 15.20b-21a.  
206 *Xunzi* 11.12a; *Liji* 5.4a, 5.9a, 5.20a.  
207 *Zuozhuan* 13.26b.  
208 *Shangshu* 213.  
209 *Lunyu* 16: 7.  
210 *Zhuangzi* 2.9a.  
211 *Shangshu* 54-55, 157, 201, 539.  
212 *Shangshu* 532; *Shijing* 263/2; *Zuozhuan* 13.14a, 29.19a; *Mozi* 7.1a-1b, 7.12b; *Mengzi* 3B:2; *Zhuangzi* 7.4a; *Liezi* 8.10a; *Liji* 8.7b.  
213 *Xunzi* 19.4b.  
214 *Guoyu* 19.10a-10b.  
215 *Guoyu* 12.1a-1b.  
216 *Xunzi* 18.5b.  
217 *Hanfeizi* 1.4b.  
218 *Zhuangzi* 8.17a.  
219 *Guoyu* 13.6a-6b; *Hanfeizi* 15.5a-5b.

- 
- 220 *Guoyu* 9.1a.  
221 *Guoyu* 11.2b-3a.  
222 *Zuozhuan* 2.3a-3b; *Guoyu* 1.14a, 3.2a, 17.1a-1b.  
223 *Mozi* 7.1a-1b, 7.12b.  
224 *Mozi* 7.12b; *Liji* 1.15b, 16.1a.  
225 *Shangshu* 62, 78.  
226 *Shangshu* 576-577.  
227 *Zuozhuan* 21.24a; *Guanzi* 3.16a; cf. *Liji* 19.13a.  
228 *Shangshu* 531; *Guanzi* 6.8a.  
229 *Zuozhuan* 19.5a; *Xunzi* 19.14a; *Hanfeizi* 12.9b, 17.7b; cf. *Shangshu* 213.  
230 *Liji* 6.18b.  
231 *Liji* 11.4b.  
232 *Shangshu* 381, 498; *Zuozhuan* 12.9a, *Yijing* 6.2b.  
233 *Liji* 7.21a, 11.7a.  
234 *Liji* 15.9a.  
235 *Mengzi* 2A:7.  
236 *Zuozhuan* 8.8b.  
237 *Mozi* 1.4b.  
238 *Liji* 14.13b.  
239 *Shijing* 200/3; *Lunyu* 1: 14, 2: 18, 19: 25; *Guanzi* 4.4b; *Yijing* 3.8a, 7.5b; *Hanfeizi* 13.6a.  
240 *Lunyu* 2: 18; *Yijing* 7.5b; *Hanfeizi* 13.6a; *Xiaojing* 8.1b; *Liji* 19.5a.  
241 *Shangshu* 183, 210-211; *Lunyu* 1.9; *Liji* 6.23a.  
242 *Xunzi* 2.4b; *Liji* 7.16a, 16.1a, 19.9b.  
243 *Shangshu* 161, 202, 346; *Liji* 19.13b.  
244 *Shangshu* 613.  
245 *Liji* 5.17b.  
246 *Xunzi* 16.11b.  
247 *Xunzi* 14.2b.  
248 *Lushichunqiu* 15.1a-1b.  
249 *LushiChunqiu* 10.4b.  
250 *Liji* 16.9b.  
251 *Liji* 17.9a.  
252 *Lunyu* 19: 25.  
253 *Mengzi* 2A:7.  
254 *Xunzi* 2.6a.  
255 *Huainanzi* 9.20b.  
256 *Shangshu* 208.  
257 *Liji* 17.12a.  
258 *Shangshu* 433.  
259 *Liji* 1.8a.  
260 *Liji* 10.18a.  
261 *Shijing* 258/6; *Guoyu* 1.9a, 18.1b.  
262 *Shangshu* 231.  
263 *Shangshu* 153-155, 304, cf. 296.  
264 *Shangshu* 250.  
265 *Lunyu* 5: 16.  
266 *Guoyu* 14.5b; *Lunyu* 13: 19.  
267 *Shangshu* 326-327; *Lunyu* 16: 10.  
268 *Xunzi* 1.12b.  
269 *Liji* 9.13b.  
270 *Lunyu* 15: 5.  
271 *Lunyu* 12: 5; *Xunzi* 1.6a, 17.8b, 20.17b; *Liji* 17.4a; *Yijing* 7.6a.  
272 *Lunyu* 17: 6; *Mengzi* 4A:16.

- 
- <sup>273</sup> *Mengzi* 5B:4.  
<sup>274</sup> *Mengzi* 4A:16.  
<sup>275</sup> *Mengzi* 6A:6.  
<sup>276</sup> *Mengzi* 7A:37.  
<sup>277</sup> *Shangshu* 532-533; *Mengzi* 3A:3; *Xunzi* 2.6b, 11.7a; *Liji* 15.1a, 15.1b, 17.5a.  
<sup>278</sup> *Mengzi* 4A:16; *Xunzi* 4.7b, *Xunzi* 17.8b; *Liji* 17.11a.  
<sup>279</sup> *Shangshu* 532-533.  
<sup>280</sup> *Shangshu* 326-327, 378; *Guoyu* 1.9a.  
<sup>281</sup> *Shangshu* 466.  
<sup>282</sup> *Liji* 11.23a-23b, 14.12b, 17.1b.  
<sup>283</sup> *Liji* 11.1a, 15.1a, 15.1b.  
<sup>284</sup> *Lunyu* 11: 21.  
<sup>285</sup> *Xunzi* 14.1b; *Liji* 11.24b.  
<sup>286</sup> *Liji* 11.23a-23b, 14.12b.  
<sup>287</sup> *Guanzi* 20.10a.  
<sup>288</sup> *Liji* 14.13b.  
<sup>289</sup> *Liji* 17.16a.  
<sup>290</sup> *Liji* 14.17b.  
<sup>291</sup> *Xunzi* 14.2a.  
<sup>292</sup> *Xunzi* 14.2b.  
<sup>293</sup> *Guanzi* 20.10b.  
<sup>294</sup> *Liji* 11.23a, 14.12b.  
<sup>295</sup> *Guanzi* 16.9b.  
<sup>296</sup> *Liji* 17.6a.  
<sup>297</sup> *Guanzi* 20.10b.  
<sup>298</sup> *Liji* 11.23a-23b, 14.12b.  
<sup>299</sup> *Lunyu* 2: 20.  
<sup>300</sup> *Lunyu* 15: 33.  
<sup>301</sup> *Guanzi* 20.10b, cf. 16.9b.  
<sup>302</sup> *Guanzi* 20.10a.  
<sup>303</sup> *Guanzi* 16.9b.  
<sup>304</sup> *Shijing* 272/1; *Zuozhuan* 2.24b, 8.9b, 9.12a-12b, 19.23b-24b; *Lunyu* 20: 2; *Mengzi* 1B:3.  
<sup>305</sup> *Shangshu* 466.  
<sup>306</sup> *Xunzi* 2.2a.  
<sup>307</sup> *Zuozhuan* 15.23a, 20.5b; *Xunzi* 2.2a; *Liji* 1.1a, 1.18a.  
<sup>308</sup> *Xunzi* 2.3a; *Liji* 17.5a, 17.7b; cf. *Yijing* 8.4b.  
<sup>309</sup> *Xunzi* 4.10b, 7.14a-14b.  
<sup>310</sup> *Zuozhuan* 15.23a.  
<sup>311</sup> *Mengzi* 1B:3.  
<sup>312</sup> *Lunyu* 16: 8.  
<sup>313</sup> *Shijing* 272/1; *Zuozhuan* 8.9b, 9.12a-12b, *Mengzi* 1B:3.  
<sup>314</sup> *Zuozhuan* 2.24b, 19.23b-24b.  
<sup>315</sup> *Lunyu* 20: 2; cf. *Liji* 17.1a.  
<sup>316</sup> *Zuozhuan* 19.23b-24b.  
<sup>317</sup> *Xiaojing* 5.4b; cf. *Guanzi* 20.10b.  
<sup>318</sup> *Guoyu* 1.2b, 14.1b; *Guanzi* 10.2a.  
<sup>319</sup> *Shijing* 76/3; cf. *Guoyu* 10.2b.  
<sup>320</sup> *Hanfeizi* 4.5a.  
<sup>321</sup> *Guanzi* 15.14a; *Liji* 17.2b.  
<sup>322</sup> *Zuozhuan* 5.29a, 25.11a; *Guanzi* 15.5a; *Hanfeizi* 1.12a, 2.6a, 4.16a-16b.  
<sup>323</sup> *Hanfeizi* 2.6a, 10.7b-8a, 14.3b.  
<sup>324</sup> *Guoyu* 19.2b; *Zuozhuan* 1.14b; *Hanfeizi* 2.16b.  
<sup>325</sup> *Guanzi* 2.8a, 21.5b; *Laozi* 2.21b, no. 74.

- 
- <sup>326</sup> *Xunzi* 5.1b, 6.7a; *Guanzi* 1.17a, 21.9b; *Hanfeizi* 6.3a.  
<sup>327</sup> *Shangshu* 284.  
<sup>328</sup> *Shijing* 258/6; *Guoyu* 18.1b; *Lunyu* 6: 22; *Liji* 1.18a.  
<sup>329</sup> *Guoyu* 1.13b.  
<sup>330</sup> *Zuozhuan* 9.11a; *Xunzi* 13.11b-12a; *Liji* 10.18a, 14.25a.  
<sup>331</sup> *Mengzi* 2B:2, 4A:2.  
<sup>332</sup> *Xiaojing* 1.3a.  
<sup>333</sup> *Guoyu* 6.3a, 7.6a.  
<sup>334</sup> *Liji* 14.6a.  
<sup>335</sup> *Zuozhuan* 7.21; *Guoyu* 11.1a; *Mengzi* 6A:5, 6B:7, 7A:15.  
<sup>336</sup> *Mengzi* 4B:28.  
<sup>337</sup> *Guoyu* 6.4b.  
<sup>338</sup> *Guoyu* 3.10a.  
<sup>339</sup> *Lunyu* 2.20.  
<sup>340</sup> *Lunyu* 12: 2.  
<sup>341</sup> *Shangshu* 209-210, 426-427, 429.  
<sup>342</sup> *Shijing* 299/4.  
<sup>343</sup> *Liji* 14.13b.  
<sup>344</sup> *Shijing* 194/3, *Liji* 15.5b, 15.6a.  
<sup>345</sup> *Xunzi* 11.8a-8b.  
<sup>346</sup> *Liji* 8.10a.  
<sup>347</sup> *Guoyu* 1.15a-15b.  
<sup>348</sup> *Zuozhuan* 4.6b; *Lunyu* 1: 5, 15: 38, 16: 10; cf. *Shijing* 276/1.  
<sup>349</sup> *Guoyu* 2.11b.  
<sup>350</sup> *Zuozhuan* 14.6b; *Lunyu* 13: 19.  
<sup>351</sup> *Shijing* 196/2, 253/3, 256/2, 256/5, 299/4.  
<sup>352</sup> *Xunzi* 7.13b, 18.6b.  
<sup>353</sup> *Xunzi* 7.12a, 8.8a.  
<sup>354</sup> *Liji* 11.1b.  
<sup>355</sup> *Guoyu* 14.5b; *Liji* 11.5a.  
<sup>356</sup> *Zuozhuan* 4.8a.  
<sup>357</sup> *Guoyu* 3.9b-10b, *Lunyu* 15: 6.  
<sup>358</sup> *Shijing* 200/7.  
<sup>359</sup> *Mengzi* 5A:6.  
<sup>360</sup> *Shangshu* 581.  
<sup>361</sup> *Shangshu* 388, 609.  
<sup>362</sup> *Shangshu* 397, 489.  
<sup>363</sup> *Shangshu* 429.  
<sup>364</sup> *Lunyu* 6: 2.  
<sup>365</sup> *Shijing* 286/1, cf. 288/1.  
<sup>366</sup> *Lunyu* 12: 5.  
<sup>367</sup> *Lunyu* 14: 42.  
<sup>368</sup> *Yijing* 1.7a.  
<sup>369</sup> *Guoyu* 3.9b-10b.  
<sup>370</sup> *Mengzi* 2A:6 and 6A:6; *Xunzi* 13.2b; *Liji* 1.2b, *Guanzi* 3.17b.  
<sup>371</sup> *Liji* 15.2b, 17.4a, 20.6b, 20.14b-15a; *Xiaojing* 3.3a.  
<sup>372</sup> *Liji* 11.9b.  
<sup>373</sup> *Liji* 17.6a.  
<sup>374</sup> *Zuozhuan* 20.24a.  
<sup>375</sup> *Yijing* 8.6b-7a.  
<sup>376</sup> *Lunyu* 4: 13; *Zuozhuan* 15.14a-14b.  
<sup>377</sup> *Liji* 1.3a.  
<sup>378</sup> *Zuozhuan* 20.18b-19a.

---

<sup>379</sup> *Mozi* 2.3a.

<sup>380</sup> *Zuozhuan* 16.23a; *Guoyu* 17.1b-2a; *Xunzi* 19.4b.

<sup>381</sup> *Shijing* 253/3, 256/2, 299/4; *Zuozhuan* 19.23b, 20.19a; *Mozi* 8.4b; *Liji* 19.8a, 20.2b.

<sup>382</sup> *Xunzi* 10.7a-7b, 17.11a; *Liji* 11.23a-23b.

<sup>383</sup> *Xunzi* 10.7a-7b, 19.4b.

<sup>384</sup> *Shijing* 254/8.

<sup>385</sup> *Shijing* 263/1; *Mengzi* 3B:2.

<sup>386</sup> *Xunzi* 10.7a-7b, 13.6b; *Huainanzi* 18.13a; *Liji* 17.9a; cf. *Zuozhuan* 17.22a.

<sup>387</sup> *Lunyu* 5: 16, 16: 10; *Liji* 10.18a.

<sup>388</sup> *Mengzi* 6A:6, 7A:37; *Xunzi* 2.2a-2b.

<sup>389</sup> *Zuozhuan* 15.23a, 20.5b; *Xunzi* 2.2a, 2.3a.

<sup>390</sup> *Liji* 11.1a, 11.23a-23b, 14.12b, 15.1a-1b 17.1b.

<sup>391</sup> *Liji* 1.1a.

<sup>392</sup> cf. *Xunzi* 18.6b & *Liji* 1.18a.

<sup>393</sup> *Liji* 19.11b.

<sup>394</sup> I am indebted to an anonymous reviewer for helpful suggestions that I incorporated when revising an earlier version of this paper.